

The Adaptation of Knowledge and Skills to Labour Market Expectations: Transnational Inquiries into Further Education among Migrants with Foreign University Degrees

Arnd-Michael Nohl

Prof. Dr. Arnd-Michael Nohl

Helmut-Schmidt-Universität Hamburg

Professur für Erziehungswissenschaft, insbesondere systematische Pädagogik

Postfach 700822

22008 Hamburg

Cultural Capital During Migration Research Paper Nr. 5

April / 2008

www.cultural-capital.net

The international study group “Cultural Capital during Migration. Towards the relevance of education titles and residence permits for the status passage into the labour market” is funded by the VW Foundation for three years (2005-2008). The group studies the integration of highly qualified migrants into the labour market. The labour market integration of migrants can become an opportunity for knowledge societies because their prosperity depends on the incorporation and improvement of cultural capital. This research group studies how migrants make use of their cultural capital during their entry into the labour market. A systematic comparison of status groups who differ with respect to the level of their educational title, the place of its acquisition (at home or abroad) as well as to their residence status will show how their transition into the labour market is structured by the interrelation of both factors. The status passages will be empirically analysed taking meso- and macro-social contexts (networks, social exclusion, institutional rules etc.) into account. Every status group will be researched in the context of Germany and of one country of comparison respectively (Canada, Great Britain and Turkey). A project council will ensure the transfer of results to administrative and political practice.

Editorial Board:

Arnd-Michael Nohl (Helmut-Schmidt-University Hamburg)

Karin Schittenhelm (University of Siegen)

Oliver Schmidtke (University of Victoria, Canada)

Anja Weiß (Ludwig-Maximilians-University Munich)

© The copyright of the paper stays with the author

Our Discussion Papers often represent preliminary work and are circulated to encourage discussion. Citation of such a paper should account for its provisional character. A revised version may be available directly from the author.

The Adaptation of Knowledge and Skills to Labour Market Expectations: Transnational Inquiries into Further Education among Migrants with Foreign University Degrees

Arnd-Michael Nohl

Contents

1. Introduction	4
2. Improving cultural capital by further education during free market careers.....	6
2.1 Transnational features: Formal and informal ways of acquiring the appropriate language skills	6
2.2 Turkey and Germany: Learning the codes of qualified local labour.....	16
2.3 Canada: Accepting unqualified jobs for the sake of local work experience	22
2.4 Germany: Formal further education in connection with qualified labour market positions	28
2.5 Comparative issues: How managers with foreign academic titles enhance their knowledge and skills in Germany, Turkey, and Canada.....	32
3. Training on the job within professional law-ruled career tracks.....	34
3.1 Transnational features: The importance of formalized further education for doctors	34
3.2 Country-specific peculiarities in language acquisition	41
4. Further education as a loss of cultural capital	42
4.1 Germany: Downgrading education	42
4.2 Canada: Unsuccessful academic training.....	47
5. Summary: Transnational and national features of the adaptation of knowledge and skills to labour market expectations	50
6. References	54

1. Introduction

University degrees are a prerequisite but not sufficient for attaining qualified positions on the labour market. What holds true for autochthonous employees is even more significant for migrants who have obtained their university education outside the country of their labour market inclusion. These migrants whom we have interviewed in our research project on “Cultural Capital during Migration” sometimes have to face severe obstacles when they try to find adequate jobs. It is not only that their educational certificates may not get acknowledged by the respective employer or the responsible state agency. Apart from or in addition to these formal barriers they experience a gap between their own knowledge and skills on the one hand and the expectations of employers on the other. This is the point in time when migrants feel obliged to improve their knowledge and skills and to adapt them towards labour market expectations.

It is the purpose of this research paper to empirically analyse those experiences and orientations of migrants which relate to further education and labour market integration. In this context, further education may refer to informal, non-formal and formal educational activities. The empirical analysis is based on a selection out of appr. 180 narrative interviews conducted with migrants. Cases included in this analysis range from illegal migrants without any legal labour market access to those migrants who have labour market access formally equal to autochthonous people.

The analysis at hand is based on previous research on the labour market inclusion of the migrants interviewed during the study on “Cultural Capital during Migration”.¹ However, the results of this previous research remain confined to specific countries and specific case groups.² The paper at hand takes up some of these results and aims at comparing various cases across countries and across different sociological characteristics.

The theoretical questions behind this comparative analysis are as follows: Under which conditions and how do migrants enhance their knowledge and skills obtained abroad by taking part in any kind of further education in the country of their migration? How are the original and the newly acquired stocks of knowledge and skills transferred into cultural capital through the migrants’ inclusion into the labour market? How are the labour market position and subsequently the cultural capital of these migrants improved by taking part in further education?³

With these theoretical questions in mind I will go into the depth of the empirical data on migrants with foreign degrees collected in our research project. However the comparison of the various cases situated in Germany, Canada and Turkey will not only be structured by the theoretical questions but also by some methodological considerations. Rather than comparing arbitrarily selected cases the investigation will start by taking into account only specific migrants. Preliminary research has revealed typical patterns of using one’s knowledge and skills on the labour market. Those migrants whose patterns of labour market indicate homologies are sampled in “typologically situated case groups” (Nohl 2008). Cross-country comparison

1. For a general outline of the project cf. Nohl et al. 2006.

2. Some of these research results have already been published (cf. Nohl et al. 2007; Nohl/Schittenhelm 2008; Ofner/Nohl 2008; Brosius 2008).

3. As indicated by the reference to “cultural capital”, these theoretical questions – together with the empirical results of this paper – will be considered and elaborated in the frame of an empirically substantial theory on the development of cultural capital during the inclusion of migrants into the labour market (cf. Nohl et al. 2009a).

then starts with those typologically situated case groups which share homologous patterns of labour market inclusion albeit country-specific and other differences. After comparing the first set of homologous typologically situated case groups research goes on by taking into consideration further case groups which display homologies.⁴

The combination of theoretical considerations and empirical sensitivity briefly described above shall help omitting the pitfalls of a mere theoretical or exclusively empirical juxtaposition of cases to be compared.⁵ Such a theoretically informed and empirically sensitive approach might be called ‘reflexive juxtaposition of empirical cases’ as it refers to a reflexive relation of theoretical and empirical considerations during comparison.

My investigation will start with those persons who enhanced their knowledge and skills during a management career (chapter 2). It will go on by comparing those cases where we have identified trajectories heavily based on professional law (doctors) and including training on the job (chapter 3). Finally those case groups will be given attention in which a loss of cultural capital due to or inspite of further education can be identified. Here migrants receive either further education below their original academic titles or are not able to make use of the academic further education received (chapter 4).⁶ Only after these different typologically situated case groups have been investigated it is possible to draw some conclusions towards differences pertaining to phenomena considered country-specific or typical for the legal access to the labour market. However there are also transnational features in the adaptation of knowledge and skills to labour market expectations (chapter 5).

4. I have methodologically reflected this research strategy in a separate paper, cf. Nohl 2008.

5. Whereas in a previous paper (cf. Nohl 2008) I have emphasized the necessity of empirical juxtaposition vis-à-vis theoretical juxtaposition, Karin Schittenhelm, in personal communication, has underpinned the importance of keeping theoretical questions in mind also during the empirical analysis.

6. The definition of these typologically situated case groups is strongly based on the study carried out among the Berlin-Hamburg sample (see Nohl et al. 2007). However there are similar case groups identifiable among the other samples in Munich, in Turkey as well as in Canada, although they may not have been labelled as such by the respective investigators.

2. Improving cultural capital by further education during free market careers

In this chapter I analyse migrants who enhanced their knowledge and skills before or during a management career. I only take those cases into regard whose cultural capital is not considered transnational in advance but who have to slowly improve their cultural capital while they are already included in some position on the labour market. The analysis starts with exploring the ways of acquiring language skills (2.1), then looks into how migrants learn the codes of qualified labour in Germany and Turkey (2.2) which then is differentiated from the peculiarity of acquiring “Canadian work experience” as such (2.3). After considering the importance of formal further education in Germany (2.4) some comparative results are summarized (2.5).

2.1 *Transnational features: Formal and informal ways of acquiring the appropriate language skills*

It might be taken as a foregone conclusion that migrants have to learn the language of the country of their destination. This is surely the case for those migrants interviewed who pursue a management career. However, as this working paper will show, language does not necessarily need to play a major role in labour market inclusion. In contrast to the Germany-based doctors analysed in chapter 3, there is evidence that for management positions one does not only need a good command of the official language of the country but also skills in the appropriate use of this language. Although language acquisition turned out to be a common feature of migrants in all countries investigated, the following analysis will go into the respective cases country by country. I shall begin with the Turkish context, proceed with Germany and conclude with Canada.

Turkey: The first of our cases in Turkey is *Mr Sak*, an economist who was born in 1947 in Turkestan and raised in the capital of the Soviet republic of Uzbekistan.⁷ Mr Sak held a position as the dean of an institute at what he calls the “Finance University” of the city when he was invited to do an internship in the chamber of business in Istanbul in the 1990’s. There he was offered a position as an investment consultant in a private firm and charged with enhancing business relations with companies in the former Eastern block countries. After several years in this position he accepted a job as the editor of an Islamist publishing house.

In the following section of the interview the researcher recalls that Mr Sak had mentioned not to have had any feelings of strangeness when he first came to Turkey, and then asks him to expand on the experiences of these first days in Istanbul and his language acquisition (TRN09, Mr Sak, 551-577):

Interv. O zaman siz isterseniz Türkiye’ye geldiğiniz döneme bir dönemim. Siz şey dediniz, ben ilk çalıştığım yerde kendimi yabancı hissetmedim, beni yabancı olarak kabul etmediler, aynı zamanda tercüman olarak çalışmaya başladınız. Yani o ilk dönem sizin nasıldı, dil bilgisini nereden öğrendiniz. O yakınlığı, ne bileyim, yabancı olmama şeysinden bahsedebilir misiniz? Bütün bu ilk sürecinden.

TRN09: Hı hı şimdi genelde ((aaaa)) denirki iki dil öğrendikten sonra başkalarını öğrenmesi kolay oluyor. Biz ailede arapça öğrendik, farsça öğrendik, rusca öğrendik, okulda ingilizce okutuluyordu. //hı hı// bunun yanısıra biraz türkçeden de habirimiz vardı. Bağımsızlıktan sonra çok Türkiye’den iş adamları gelmeye _____ başladılar. Türkiye’den gelenlerle ben tanıştım, dil farkımız olduğunu

7. All personal information has been changed in order to guarantee the anonymity of the interviewees.

anladım ve gereken kitap edininip Türkçemi geliştirmeye çalıştım. Tabi ki çok iyi öğrendiğimi söyleyemem. Memleketinde. Ama.

Interv. Siz memleketinde öğrenmeye mi başladınız?

TRN09: Evet memleketinde öğrenmeye başladım. Ve memleketinde belli bir seviyeye getirdim. Oraya gelen Türklere yardımcı olabilecek kadar türkçem vardı. Sonra buraya gelince de ((hımm)) baktım buralı adamlar gibi konuşmasam bile ama anlamakta hiç problemim yok. Bundan dolayı ben kendimi hiç şey hissetmedim. Bariyer olmayınca //hı hı// dil bariyeri. Dil sadece dil değil ki, ((ığğğ)) dili bilince kültürü biliyorsun, ortak yönlerini biliyorsun, ((aaağğğf)) öyle bir his duygu vardı yani, bizim aynı dinden olmamız da çok önemliydi burda. Ben kendim şey (.) dindar adam olarak benim için önemliydi. Namaz kılıyordum, buralı adamlarla beraber, // hı hı// yani dünyaya bakışımız, hayata bakışımız çok konularda aynı (.) olduğu insana yabancılık çekmemeye (.) deden oluyordu //hı hı// benim aynı dinden olmam (.) belki burada yabancılık çektiydi diye düşünüyorum.

Although Mr Sak emphasizes that after the acquisition of two languages it is “easy to learn others”, he cannot but acknowledge that although he had basic skills in Turkish he discovered the need to improve them when he first had the opportunity to speak to Turkish business men visiting his country: “I understood that our languages are different and I bought the necessary books and tried to develop my Turkish”. However, these first efforts, which go back to the time when he was still in Uzbekistan, did not turn out to be too successful: “Of course I cannot say that I learned it very well. In my home country.”

Apparently Mr Sak has acquired his proficiency in Turkish only after he came to Istanbul. Nevertheless he denies any feeling of strangeness, emphasizing that being at least able to understand the Turkish of Turkey he also felt acquainted with its culture and its religion, the latter of which he shared as a pious Muslim anyway. Although we cannot find any empirical material which would show how this migrant from Uzbekistan has improved his active Turkish I presume that he used the opportunity of speaking and writing Turkish both within his job and in the frame of his religious activities. One reason why language acquisition does not play such a big role in the interview (though it might have been quite an effort for Mr Sak to learn the Turkish of Turkey) might be that in Turkey people from the Turkish republics are assumed to speak Turkish or at least a variation of Turkish by the Turks themselves. Thus, language differences tend to be denied (although they are just undeniable as the author of this paper experienced himself).

Mr Lor, the second one of our relevant cases in Turkey, talks about his language acquisition in greater detail. As a German who came to Turkey as the spouse of a teacher at the German embassy school, it is impossible for him to rely on any assumption of cultural proximity to the Turks. Hence, Mr Lor experiences the lack of Turkish language skills as a major obstacle during his first steps in Istanbul and into the labour market (TRN01, Mr Lor, 118-164):

TRN01: Dann hab ich mich natürlich zunächst mal mit der Sprache beschäftigt, eigentlich, sagen wir mal so, die Grundstufe abgeschlossen, gleich sogar die vom Anfang, und aber dann keinen weiteren Kurs besucht, äh sondern selbstständig selbstständig das gemacht, also Vokabeln gelernt und da ich mal Latein hatte in der Schule, hat man auch so ne Vorstellung von Grammatik. //mmh// Das hilft einem beim Türkischen dann ja doch. //mmh// Und ja, so hab ich mich dann durchgewurschtelt und hab dann, eigentlich muss ich grad mal überlegen wie lange, () noch anderthalb Jahre keinen Kurs gemacht, um dann wieder auf der Mittelstufe einzusteigen und das dann bis zum türkischen Sprachdiplom durchzuziehen, auch ausgehend von der Erkenntnis, dass man ohne türkische Sprachkenntnisse eigentlich nur in ei- bestimmten Fällen, für mich sind's eigentlich eher Sonderfälle, hier überhaupt einen Job kriegen kann. //mmh// Ich hab zwischendurch mal (.), als ich noch nicht so gut Türkisch konnte, wohl schon so, also Zeitung lesen konnte ich noch nicht, so, ich konnte mich aber so über einige Themen unterhalten, habe ich bei einer Firma mehr so als Berater gearbeitet. Das war eine Firma, die, na wie sollen wir das nennen, in der einfachsten Beschreibung, das würde die Firma nicht so mögen, haben die websites gemacht, //mmh// in der etwas besseren Beschreibung war das ein IT-Dienstleister, der so moderne, ähm, Internet und Informationstechnologie-Dienstleistungen anbietet. //mmh// Und die wollten auch in die Pharmaindustrie rein, weil es da einige so business to business-Dienstleistungen gibt, die sie anbieten können und wollten, aber sie hatten da wohl, sie kannten den Markt nicht. Und da war ich mal tätig, ne Zeit lang.

Aber dies ist schlichtweg daran gescheitert, dass ich nicht in der Lage war, Kunden () zu betreiben, auf Türkisch. Auf Deutsch wär's natürlich schon irgendwie gegangen, oder, ob's geklappt hätte, ist ne andere Sache, aber da hätt ich's machen können zumindest. Aber auf Türkisch war das einfach nicht drin, schlicht und einfach. Echt nicht. ((Flugzeuggeräusche)) Und alle anderen hatten ihre eigenen Projekte und waren natürlich nicht mal eben abkömmlich, um so ein Projekt anzuschieben. //mmh// Und das hab ich deshalb dann auch einfach auslaufen lassen. Obwohl's nicht schlecht war, die Idee, die Geschäftsidee war ganz gut. Also sowohl ich glaube, dass die in Ordnung war @(.).@, wie auch der Firmeninhaber hielt was von der Idee. Aber war so in der Konstellation nicht umsetzbar, und mit sozusagen dieser Erkenntnis im Rücken habe ich nochmals die Schulbank gedrückt, oder bin halt dann in diese ganzen Türkischkurse gegangen, um es dann bis zum Sprachdiplom zu bringen,

Mr Lor's first steps in the Turkish language, both formal and informal, seem to have facilitated his everyday life as a spouse of an international mobile professional but have not been sufficient for the Turkish labour market. Soon after Mr Lor begins to work in a small IT counseling business he discovers that he will not be able to perform this job up to the requirements of his employer due only to his lack of proficiency in Turkish. This is the major motivation to start learning Turkish in language courses again, until he receives the Turkish language diploma.

However, Mr Lor soon realizes that formal training is not quite enough to acquire proficiency in the appropriate use of the language. "It only begins" after the diploma, he emphasizes. His subsequent efforts in improving his Turkish skills are accompanied by disappointing experiences on the labour market (TRN01, Mr Lor, 162-189):

TRN01: und mit sozusagen dieser Erkenntnis im Rücken habe ich nochmals die Schulbank gedrückt, oder bin halt dann in diese ganzen Türkischkurse gegangen, um es dann bis zum Sprachdiplom zu bringen, was natürlich erstmal, Sie wissen das ja, sich nach viel anhört, aber im Endeffekt gar nichts ist, denn dann fängt's nämlich erst richtig an @(.).@. Also das ist natürlich schon mal ne Hürde, die es erst zu nehmen gilt, aber dann hat man vielleicht die Basis, auf der man richtig Türkisch lernen kann. //mmh// Das ist natürlich auch ne sozusagen bittere Erkenntnis, aber sie schafft einem immerhin die Basis, was selbst zu machen. Und dann hab ich eigentlich doch ziemlich viel (.) versucht, nen Job zu kriegen. Und zwar (.) auf mehreren Wegen. Das eine, also ich mein, das macht man (.) klassisch, man guckt in den Zeitungen, das hab ich jetzt nicht so, da hab ich zwar doch auch zwei zwei Interviews gehabt, aber, von zwei Bewerbungen interessanterweise //mmh//, auf Zeitungsannoncen, aber ich hab mehr diese Internetportale genutzt, und, da gab's nicht so viel (.) Rücklauf, obwohl da viel interessantere Angebote eigentlich drin waren, oder, nicht interessantere, aber mehr, und breiter gefächerte. Und dann hab ich natürlich versucht, über Kontakte zu Deutschen, die in deutschen oder internationalen Firmen arbeiten, über die Aussen-Handelskammer und deren Wirtschaftsrunde und so weiter, Kontakte zu knüpfen, um über den Weg zumindest mal die Möglichkeiten zu eruieren. Und es kam dann auch so zu dem einen oder anderen Gespräch auch mit nem Geschäftsführer von Pharmafirmen hier, aber im Endeffekt äh ist die Erkenntnis, die ich dann zu diesem Zeitpunkt hatte, die, dass es für die Pharmafirmen nicht wichtig ist, ob jemand perfekt Deutsch spricht, für die Pharmafirma ist es viel wichtiger, ob jemand perfekt Türkisch spricht und sich in der Türkei wie der Fisch im Wasser bewegt. Der muss nur so gut Englisch oder Deutsch können, um seinem Chef zu erzählen, was passiert ist.

Mr Lor does not give details on the job „interviews“, which he had in Turkish companies, but it is evident from this section of the interview that they had not been successful. The general frame in which he gives this account of his first labour market experiences is the issue of language. Even when Mr Lor applied for jobs in German or international companies he had to learn, to his disappointment, that his proficiency in German and English is not what employers are interested in. One needs to “speak Turkish perfectly and to move around in Turkey like a fish in the water”, he explains. In the following section Mr Lor expands on the difficulties employers anticipated during the job interviews (TRN01, Mr Lor, 540-564):

TRN01: Also die Bewerbungsgespräche, das waren, also das eine das war ein Patentjob, der wär ganz gut gewesen in Deutschland, der wär gut für mich gewesen. Den

hätt ich auch gut machen können. Das ging da um Qual- also Qualitätsmanagement in der Produktion, in der Pharmaproduktion. //mmh// Das war das, was ich fachlich verstehe, was ich, das hab ich auch noch nicht gemacht, //(hustet)// aber da verstehe ich sozusagen, da weiss ich, um was es geht. Da weiss ich im Wesentlichen, um welche Regelwerke es sich handelt. Und da kann ich, sozusagen, ja, das hätte ich umsetzen können. //mmh// So. Wär auch schwierig gewesen am Anfang, aber das wär schon drin gewesen. Auf Deutsch. Auf Englisch wär's auch gegangen. Aber nicht auf Türkisch. //mmh// Ich hätte sozusagen behörden-feste Dokumente auf Türkisch verfassen müssen. Und daran ist es gescheitert. Auf Englisch kann ich das, auf Deutsch kann ich das. Aber nicht auf Türkisch. //mmh// //mmh// Also es ging da drum, eben, man nennt das standard (operating) procedures, also, man muss eben, um so ISO-Zertifikate und so w- dergleichen zu erhalten, muss man eben dokumentieren, wie die Arbeitsabläufe sind, und wie etwas gemacht wird, damit es richtig gemacht wird. //mmh// Und das ist gerade in der Pharmaindustrie, wo man eben Medikamente herstellt, extrem wichtig. //mmh// Und so was zu organisieren is- nicht trivial, geht aber. Ja, und ähm, ja, auf Türkisch. //mmh// Es war schon die richtige Entscheidung der Firma, @mich dann nicht einzustellen.@ Wie gesagt, auf Türkisch geht das nicht. Oder da hätten sie mir en Dolmetscher noch einstellen müssen. Und da, dann finden sie aber auch einen Türken, der das machen kann.

As is apparent in this section of the interview, for Mr Lor the reluctance of employers to hire him is legitimate. Although he has the professional qualification necessary for supervising the quality management of pharmaceutical products he admits that he would need to be able to produce administrative documents in Turkish which he indeed cannot. Therefore, he perceives himself to be a less attractive job applicant than his colleagues with Turkish mother tongue.

Because Mr Lor insists on being able to produce such letter in his first foreign language, English, and because he has already been learning Turkish for a longer period, one may assume that for Mr Lor Turkish is a far more difficult language than English. Full command of the appropriate language seems outside the realms of possibility. Finally, Mr Lor finds a position for which he holds quite unique qualifications and at the same time does not need a perfect command of Turkish (TRN01, Mr Lor, 246-271):

TRN01: im ((Telefon klingelt)) Endeffekt war es dann wieder so, dass einem der Zufall zu Hilfe kommt, dass ich über Studienkollege, oder alte Bekannte hier auch jemand kennengelernt habe, der in der Branche tätig ist und ähm, im Endeffekt war das dann so, dass die jemand gesucht haben mit meiner Qualifikation, durch Zufall. //mmh// Und, ja (.) also jetzt mach ich nicht mehr Medikamentenentwicklung, sond- äh pardon, nicht mehr Medikamentenforschung, sondern Medikamentenentwicklung. //mmh// Das heisst, jetzt gibt es das Medikament, das is- aber noch nicht zugelassen und das muss jetzt bestimmte, wie sagen wir, gesetzlich vorbestimmte Hürden nehmen. Das hat schon die ganzen vorklinischen Hürden genommen wie Toxikologie und sonstige in-vitro Nach-, also im Reagenzglas, Nachweise, dass es wirksam ist. Aber jetzt muss es am Menschen zeigen (.), //mmh// dass es auch, das man nennt das auch in der Klinik, also, tatsächlich in der freien Wildbahn @oder so@, im tatsächlichen Benutzen wirksam ist. Und weil das natürlich schlicht und ergreifend ein Menschenversuch ist, ist das ganz stark reglementiert. Und deshalb ist das en Nischenmarkt, den meistens kleinere oder mittelgrosse Firmen bedienen für die Pharmaindustrie. Und da sind meine Qualifikationen eigentlich ähm gefragt, weil ich auch im Labor mit ähnlichen Regelwerken zu tun hatte. Was es da so zu Beachten gilt //mmh// und so weiter und so fort. Und da war war ich also nicht mehr Berufsanfänger, oder zumindest nur noch war ich sehr nahe dran mit meiner Qualifikation mit meiner Berufserfahrung, //mmh// zum einen, und zum zweiten war die sprachliche Komponente dann nicht mehr so wichtig. //mmh// Ja, und ja, dann habe ich den Job gekriegt. (2) Ja, und das mach ich jetzt. (2)

Mr Lor overcomes the obstacles posed by the difficult language acquisition in Turkish when he “by chance” finds a job in the development of pharmaceuticals. His new employers acknowledge his specific qualifications concerning the “body of regulations” involved in the development process. Vis-à-vis these qualifications Mr Lor’s language problems were “not so important anymore”.

In the cases of both Mr Lor and Mr Sak it is documented that a good command of the appropriate language is essential for management posts in the receiving country. Whereas Mr Sak,

as the citizen of a Turkic republic, easily learns the difficult Turkish language, Mr Lor at a certain point of his career has to abandon his ambitions and to be content with a job which requires less than a full command of Turkish. In both cases it is also documented that language courses and language books are only *necessary* but not *sufficient* devices for the acquisition of the appropriate (in contrast to the grammatically correct) language. Informal language learning is a must for the command of the language used on the Turkish labour market as concerns management posts.

Interestingly the same patterns of language acquisition and usage can be shown in management careers in the German and the Canadian context. This is astonishing because the migrants interviewed in Turkey, although they share the fate of educational foreigners with our research participants in Germany and Canada, are disprivileged insofar as they only have subordinate legal access to the labour market. In contrast, the cases in Canada and Germany, which I will discuss in the remaining part of this chapter, are signified by a legal access to the labour market which is equal to citizens of the respective country. Although the (lack of) legal access surely plays a role in the labour market inclusion in Turkey, too, it is evident from the interviews interpreted above that the legal status of the migrants does not overlap and change the meaning of language acquisition. However, there are significant differences among the cases investigated in Turkey. Whereas Mr Lor and Mr Sak at least have a residence permit or even a temporary work permit, other persons without such a status (e.g. Mr Iduma and Mr Young) do not have the chance to pursue a management career.

Canada: For migrants in Canada language has a different meaning than in Turkey. Whereas in Turkey nobody would really assume a foreigner (except those from Turkic republics) to have a good command of Turkish (although the language is necessary for many positions on the labour market), in Canada the respective language (French or English) seems to be an unquestionable prerequisite. For managerial posts this goes so far as to include the expectation to speak English with a Canadian accent.

The unquestionability of English is evident even in the case of *Ms Lyuba Goudareva* who used to be a chemist back in Russia before she took the decision to migrate to Canada. She expresses her astonishment about a person who had hired her as an “assistant housekeeping manager” without any knowledge of the language (ACAN 15, Lyuba Goudareva, 100-123):

ACAN 15: “Anyway, it was scary, it was really scary ... ahm... a couple of days we were just trying to adapt to the time difference ... twelve hours ... eleven ... and then I just started to write a resume, which Andrew made for me ... totally lame resume ... ahm ... first we tried to put my education, then we decided ... I can't find anything ... nobody needs me with all my experience in chemistry and ... I actually didn't have anything else. I had education, I had a chemistry production and that is it. And my own business ... who cares about that business ... anyway and then we transformed it totally ... lied in every line... said that I'm some... I don't know, I finished mechanical college or something like that ... and worked as a ...ahm... what is it called ... as a chambermaid. But actually I worked as a chambermaid ... when I did my application when my papers were going through...it took 2.5 years actually... I went to Israel, sold my apartment first, got divorced ... went to Israel to work ... did chamber maid of course ...but it is not that experience to convince people that I can do that ...”//Right// Yeah, and in two weeks I was hired ... but was fired in three weeks, because of English ... because I didn't speak a word ...”

Schmidtke: “What kind of job was this?”

ACAN 15: “It is assistant manager in the hotel”

Marry: “Oh, wow....”

ACAN 15: “Yes, assistant housekeeping manager ...in the hotel... but, you know, again, a french lady ...ahm.. How can you hire, if you see person doesn't speak ... hire her for something //Something else //Yes, for chambermaid job she will be happy to do that even, you know?”//Yeah //Anyway that was ...ahm... crucial

.... experience. And in a week I found just room attendance job and I went to school right away of course to learn English. And in a month I became head housekeeper in that hotel ...”

After her first discouraging experiences as a chemist Ms Goudareva decides to make up her CV and try her chance in the cleaning sector where she had gained some experience when she had been in Israel. By chance she is hired as an “assistant housekeeping manager” in a hotel. Later in the interview she states that “maybe because I had my own business that manager’s skills” (353-354) were appreciated as well as the fact that she would work for a very small wage. However, it is documented in this experience that even where knowledge of the English language is not a prerequisite for hiring a lower manager it turns out to be a huge obstacle for successful managerial work. After being laid off Ms Goudareva understands that her English needs to be improved and joins a language course. She starts working first as a “chamber maid” and then soon gets upgraded to a lower managerial position again.

Especially for higher and more qualified positions not only a good command of English is necessary, but also knowledge of the local English. That is migrants need to know how to use English in the very situation, e.g. when they speak in business related situations. In *Ms Milagros Palacios’* case it is evident that when she first came to Canada her school English learned at school, although acquired at a „bilingual school“, was not sufficient for usage on the qualified labour market. Thus she differentiates between her language acquisition back home and learning passive and active usage of English in Canada (ACAN09, Ms Palacios, 146-152):

I: So, how did you learn English? Did you learn it back home already?
ACAN09: Um, yes, well I went to a bilingual school, but that's not, that's, um, I think I learned English- well I came here speaking English, but not as good. //mmh// So I took some English lessons here. Because you can, you can learn English for all your life in a non-speaking, non-English speaking country, and that's not the same. //yeah// When you come here, you say what!?, what does she say?
//yeah// So, I come here speaking English, understanding it, and everything. But I think in these four years I have improved my English. //mmh// Especially my listening and my speaking.

One of the major places where Ms Palacios was able to learn the appropriate use of English was the “Fraser Institute” where she first did an internship and then was employed as a full time researcher (see also chapter 2.3). Interestingly Ms Palacios does not only rely on informal ways of learning English but takes “some English lessons” (probably from private teachers), too.

Mr Schwerdtfeger, a migrant from Sweden and Germany respectively, did not experience difficulties with the English language. Several reasons may explain why during the interview he did not even mention any language problems. First of all he had already done an internship in an English speaking environment in India. Secondly, he has been married to a Canadian born woman with whom he speaks English. Thirdly, he was employed by a company which appreciated his skills in languages other than English, i.e. in German and Swedish.

In the interview with one of the native speakers of English in our Canadian sample, *Mr John Fagan*, there is further evidence for the importance of acquiring the accepted, appropriate use of English. Mr Fagan, a migrant from English speaking South Africa who used to work as a manager in the sector of building construction, gives details of nuances in language usage (ACAN07, Mr Fagan, 187-203):

I: Was it pressure to assimilate or was it your,
 ACAN07: I think it was more us. I mean, the pressure was there, subtly, for instance going into the liquor store to buy a bottle of wine and the lady says, I dunno, you've asked her for a bottle of Gavurstein (sp?) or @whatever@ and when she's taking it she's like, "Sorry I didn't hear anything you said – I was listening to your accent." //mmh// you know, it's cool, but you talk to people and you have little communication, even though I'm speaking English, just because of the accent you have little communicational difficulties like, um, at work we were talking about a purchase order and I said, "Have you seen the last purchase order?", as in the previous one, and someone must of heard me, the 'a' as an 'o' and thought I'd "lost" a purchase order //mmh// I mean little things like this, even within the same language, seem to be a challenge, so I started to adapt my language when I was talking to Canadians so that it was easier for them to understand me, and that took away the discomfort of the interaction, but, um, eventually I was like, "Well, hang on a minute, I have some responsibility, but also some responsibility lies with the other as well" so I stopped trying so hard @(.)@

In this section of the interview, which is introduced by a question which already assumes that assimilation is not only a matter of the assimilator but also of the assimilated one, it is documented that, according to Mr Fagan's experience, grammatically correct English is not enough for getting along successfully in Canada. In fact, both examples given by the migrant pertain to quite different situations, not only as regards leisure time vs. work. Whereas in the first example (the liquor store) Mr Fagan interacts with somebody who highlights (and maybe even appreciates) the fact that he is not Canadian born, in the second example ("purchase order") his interaction partners overlook that he may speak with a different accent and hence get startled by minor pronunciation differences.

A place where Mr Fagan was able to informally 'improve' his Canadian-accented English was the work place or, more exactly, the lunches he had with his "supervisor" (ACAN07, Mr Fagan, 275-284):

ACAN07: Um, I think, also it's a bit of luck who you get for co-workers or supervisors, you know, that, uh, I had one supervisor who was really helpful with, the little cultural that you don't think about, just learning and understanding what kitty corner means or what bangs are or what poutine is, @(.)@ you learn quickly what poutine is.

I: @(.)@ I'm sure you don't want to know.

ACAN07: But yeah, but things that you don't think of know, but when you knew, it was handy to have a supervisor that could take the trouble, you know, we had a coffee or go for lunch and he'd talk to me, not just about work, but how I was settling into Canada

While Mr Fagan acquires the Canadian accent during everyday situations, he learns the idioms specific for Canada at his workplace. Interesting enough it was not during the working hours when Mr Fagan experiences advances in Canadian idiomatics, but during the "coffee"-break oder at "lunch"-time when his "supervisor" took special efforts to teach him things like "poutine" or "kitty corner".

Mr Fagan's case shows that even if a migrant speaks English as his mother-tongue he/she may be confronted with expectations to have also a good command of the country-specific peculiarities of English, both as regards accent as well as idioms. These empirical cases in mind one needs to raise the question if language serves not only as a device for communication and mutual understanding but also as a means for boundary making?⁸

Germany: Language proves to be a boundary in Germany, too. However, in this country migrants have to struggle through the difficult grammatical structure of the language and its vo-

8. At this point the empirical research will later be amended with theoretical reflections which can start with Bourdieu's notion of the legitimate language (Bourdieu 1990, cf. Henkelmann 2007).

cabulary before they are able to approach issues of accent and idiomatic language. Although this is a feature to be found both in Turkey and in Germany, migrants in the latter country are in addition confronted with the expectation that they speak German very well, not only for purposes of labour.

Ms Maria Guzman-Berg is a tax lawyer from Brazil who comes to Germany in order to live together with her boyfriend, a German lawyer she had come to know during a law course in the US. With the best intention not to be dependent on her boy friend she searched and found a job in Hamburg prior to her migration, and subsequently received a work permit as a specialist for Latin American tax law. With her good command of English she is able to do a good job at an international consultant company, but in everyday life she soon experiences trouble with her lack of German (AD03, Guzman-Berg, 33-48):

AD03: Dann bin ich nach Deutschland gekommen mit mein Arbeitsvisum schon direkt zu Arbeit. ((atmet ein)) Und dann das erste Problem war, ich konnte kein deutsch sprechen. //mhm// Und wenn man (.) angekommen is dann muss schon (.) in 3 Tage Anmeldung machen und dann zu Ausländerbehörd mit die Anmeldung-bestätigung gehen //mhm// und (.) //ahm// ((atmet ein)) und dann ((atmet aus)) (z- in) mein Fall noch zu Arbeitsamt wegen die Arbeitserlaubnis, (1) also das war (.) echt kompliziert, ich konnt kein deutsch sprechen und die Behörde auch kein englisch. (.) Und dann setzen 2 Personen die keine (.) gemeinsam Sprache haben ((räuspert sich)) (.) zusammen und () nichts ne, ((atmet ein)) Da hab ich zuerst allein versucht konnte ich nich und da hab ich mei- mein Ehemann (.) damals mein Freund dann (.) gebittet dass er z- mit mit mir (.) geht und (.) alles übersetze wei es gings nix andres //mhm mhm// (2) Dann (.) dann war ich in Deutschland dann fing ich nach 12 Tage zu arbeiten und Sprachkurs (.) zu machen, 3 Stunde pro Tag Sprachkurs, und, (.) dann (.) also 8 Stunde Arbeit (.) pro Tag. (3)

Ms Guzman-Berg fails to successfully do her business at the immigration office due to language problems. Neither does she speak German nor do the bureaucrats have a command of English. In her narrative it is documented how much Ms Guzman-Berg is oriented towards solving problems on her own without assistance by her boyfriend. She first tries to get along with the immigration office on her own and only when she understands that she will not succeed in it she asks her boyfriend for help. Immediately afterwards (and also immediately after this account) Ms Guzman-Berg stresses that she instantly started a language course although this increased her working hours up to eleven per day.

Although her job itself was based on English, Ms Guzman-Berg experienced marginalization during work due to her lack of German language skills. While her communication with the international staff was very satisfactory, she was being excluded from the informal talk among her German colleagues (AD03, Guzman-Berg, 60-86):

AD03: Aber mit de deutsche Mitarbeiter (.) hab ich ein Problem geha=bt (.) also später konnte ich das analysieren eigentlich ne, (.)//mhm// ich komm und konnte nur englisch sprechen //mhm// hab ich auch erwartet dass de Deutsch (.) da- dass die Leute in Deutschland konnte au sehr gut englisch sprechen. (.) //mhm// (1) Und das war eigentlich nich so. (.) //mhm// (1) U- und viele die eigentlich (.) also mittel englisch sprechen könnte (1) waren einfach schuchtern das zu sprechen, (.) und haben einfach sich ausgeschlossen, haben mit mir gar nicht gesprochen. //mhm// Und for misch am Anfang weiß man nicht was es bedeutet war einfach irgendwie (.) komisch also (.) diese (Wirkungen) so so (.) bin ich da und Leute sprechen einfach nicht mit mir, ignorieren ne, sogar //mhm// nicht Guten Tag weils (.) einfach ein fremde (.) Person da die= (.) mi- mit wem ich nicht kommunizieren könn, ich glaube das //mhm// war der Gedanke von von die Kollegen damals. //mhm mhm// (2) ((atmet ein)) Dann (.) also privat meine (.) meine großer Problem war diese Abhängigkeit (.) vo jemand zu haben, //mhm// ich war scho unabhängig in Brasilien ne //mhm// hab meine- (.) konnt mein Leben (fuhren) und dann (.) //mhm// geh ich hier zu Supermarkt und konnte ich keine (.) Produkt kaufen also (.) //mhm// zum Putzen weil (also) ich konnte nicht lesen al-

so ob das ein Waschenprodukt war oder @Spulprodukt war @(.)@ ((atmet ein))
Wenn die

- Y1: [@(1)@
AD03: Bilder da waren O.K. konnte ich kaufen sonst nicht@ also (1) doch, Fleisch und
Y1: [@(2)@
AD03: solche Sachen die man bestellen muss //mhm mhm// (.) also da hab ich auch
dann gelernt da muss (.) man an bisschen die Sprache schon (1) kennen also vor
nach Deutschland zu kommen, //mhm mhm// also ich habe gedacht dass englisch
reicht (.) //mhm mhm// es (.) es war nicht ausreichend (.)

As she expects people with a good command of English to speak this language with her, Ms Guzman-Berg assumes, though not explicitly, that there are other reasons for her colleagues to refuse communicating with her. It was “somehow (.) funny” that “these people” have “ignored” her at the beginning. Only later she understood that her colleagues were “too shy to speak” English. Even if not being intended this is a type of boundary making on the basis of language, too.

In addition to social marginalization at work Ms Guzman-Berg experiences difficulties during her everyday life, e.g. during shopping when she does not understand the labels of products. However, in this case it is the “dependency”, most probably the dependency on her boyfriend, that bothers her. She then concludes that English is not sufficient to get along in Germany and that she should have learned German prior to her migration.

Whereas Ms Guzman-Berg is quite surprised that she needs German to accomplish everyday life tasks, for *Ms Elvira Morales-Aznar*, a newly graduated lawyer from Portugal who came to Germany to marry her long-term boyfriend, language acquisition goes hand in hand with “getting to know the culture of this country” (AD14, Morales-Aznar, 366-410):

- AD14: jedenfalls war für mich
ähm der Gedanke da dass ich dann gedacht habe wenn ich dann hier in diesem
Land diese Kultur lern- ä:h kennenlernen möchte und au in diesem Land arbei-
ten möchte, und mich intergriern möchte anpassen oder was au immer, //mhm//
da:nn is für mich der wichtigste (.) äh Schritt demnächst äh=mhm der d- en die-
(.) diese Sprache zu lernen, //mhm// ((atmet ein)) und äh das war dann meine
Priorität. //mhm// Und das hab ich au so gemacht, erstmal mit dem mit dem äh
Goethe-Institut und dann in diesem Unternehmen habe ich (.) die ganze Compu-
terprogramme, und habe auch äh (1) ähm (.) ja ich hatte äh ähm viele Dokumen-
te, und Broschüren und //mhm// ähm (.) äh Beschreibungen von unseren äh Ge-
räten ähm in verschiedenen Sprachen auch äh übersetzen können damit //mhm//
man sie auch in Messen (.) ähm präsentiern konnte, //mhm// u:nd dann war ich
auch im Vertrieb, äh miteingebunden und da konnt ich ma sehn (.) ja (.) wie man
au geschäftlich miteinander umgeht //mhm// °(hier) in Deutschland°. ((atmet
ein)) ja und ähm ja und dass ich dann schon dachte, ich bin einigermaßen dann
schon weiter, ähm hab ich beschlossen noch mal ein ähm Abend äh (.) kurs
//mhm// (.) doch noch mal so ein (Quick) äh Grundkurs äh (.) //mhm// im Goe-
the-Institut no mal zu machen, (.) um äh dann juristisch dann richtig äh mich
bewerben zu können weil ich äh ((atmet ein)) immer mein Anstreben wa:r dass
ich dann juristisch irgenwo: auch beruflich ähm (.) etwas machen kann. //mhm//
°auch hier in Deutschland°. Ja und dann hab ich diesen Kurs gemacht und äh (.)
als ich fertig war dann hatte ich da mein Zeugnis, (.) vom Goethe-Institut dass
auch ((atmet ein)) es gibt ja auch verschiedene Stufen und wenn man dann die
//mhm// (grüne) Stufe hat dann is man noch nich geeignet für zum Beispiel für
bestimmte Berufe oder (.) //mhm// auch nich für die Universität, und deshalb
dacht ich ähm ich ich versuche dann die richtige Stufe zu erreichen damit ich
auch wirklich uneingeschränkt überall einsetzbar bin, //mhm// egal wo in mei-
nem Beruf; und (.) wenn ich au no mal in die Uni gehen muss dann geh ich in
die Uni dann brauch ich aber trotzdem dieses Zeugnis //mhm// (.) und dann hatt
ich im Goethe-Institut dieses äh Zeugnis bekommen das auch anerkannt is über-
all, als ähm ein Bewei:s dafür dass man die deutsche Sprache: (.) beherrscht. (1)
(schnalzt) und das hab ich dann da geschafft,

Ms Morales-Aznar does not differentiate between the language course she takes at the “Goethe-Institute” and her practice in German during office and translation jobs at a “company”. Both the formal and the informal learning are natural parts of her language acquisition. At a point where she understands that she has “made progress” she resumes her language course in order to study parts of the language specific to jurisprudence. Whereas prior to this course she had worked in fields outside her profession, she now is orientated toward getting ready for taking up jobs in law. This might explain why she at this stage tries hard to receive the certificate which documents that she “has a command of the (.) German language” and – most important – that she is “really unrestrictedly employable in every field” of law.

In the following part of the interview Ms Morales-Aznar gives a more detailed account of her expectations toward informal language learning during her first job as a gofer (AD14, Morales-Aznar, 283-303):

AD14: und da kamen natürlich so: die ersten Gedanken jetzt wo ich mich ein kleines bisschen (mehr) in dieser deutschen Sprache ausdrücken kann //mhm// und verständigen kann möchte ich auch beruflich ähm (.) ähm etwas machen. //mhm// (.) u:nd ähm (.) ja und so hab ich das entschieden und ähm °da hab ich:° da (.) in der ersten Zeit hatt ich mich beworben (.) ähm (.) bei diversen Unternehmen oder Rechtsanwälten, und zuerst äh (.) bi:n ich bei eine:rm bei einer GmbH bei einer privaten GmbH ä:h so als äh (.) Aushilfskraft //mhm// eingest- weil ich dacht (es mi:r) (.) alles is mir recht //mhm// und alles was ich kriegen kann is mir recht weil da kann ich- da komm ich unter Menschen, //mhm// ((atmet ein)) äh (.) durch den Kontakt kann ich auch die Sprache besser kennen //mhm// und äh (.) oder kennenlernen da kann ich auch langsam ein bisschen üben, und mehr Erfahrung ä:h äh äh erhalten und dann ((atmet ein)) dann dacht ich auch so durch Telefongespräche (äh=un-) und so weiter in diesem Unternehmen ((atmet ein)) kann ich ähm (.) au weiter (.) weil ich hatte ja in der ersten Zeit immer Probleme mit Telefongesprächen, weil die Leute die drücken sich äh sehr unterschiedlich aus, am Telefon und wenn einer ein Akzent hat oder ((atmet ein)) wenn eine:r nich so deutlich spricht //mhm// oder so (dann) hatt ich immer ein Problem, (.) mhm was hat er gesagt //@(.).@// ()? U:nd äh (.) ja und das waren dann so die Sachen die mir in der ersten Zeit wichtig warn //mhm// dass ich auch das Verständnis haben dass ich auch alles verstehn kann, um dann (.) mich dann selber verständigen zu können.

While her husband was working in the hospital Ms Morales-Aznar was sitting at home. This is the situation in which the “first thoughts” about improving her German in order to get into her profession emerge. Although being orientated toward practicing law, every job is “okay” for her because – as she stresses – it would give her the opportunity to be “among people” and learn the language. This does not include only the active speaking competencies but also “understanding” skills, especially in cases of dialect.

As is apparent from the interview section cited above, Ms Morales-Aznar doesn’t only aim at but also succeeds in finding jobs in which she can improve her language skills and even use them as a translator. Although Ms Guzman-Berg follows a quite different way of inclusion into the labour market both migrants share a high sensitivity for language issues. They experience language deficiencies as an obstacle for both labour and everyday life or, vice versa, they assume language competencies as a plus factor for “integration.”

Ms Morales-Aznar, who cannot hope to be employed as an English-speaking expert for international law, soon understands that for her profession it is important not only to know German but also to speak and write it effectively (AD14, Morales-Aznar, 342-348):

AD14: Aber in meine:m Beruf ist das anders; also man muss ja auch wirklich mit der Sprache se:hr (.) begabt sein, //mhm// un um ne bestimmte äh Auswirkung oder so (.) zu (hervorhu) //mhm// oder, ja (.) eine Folge oder so zu zu erzielen, und man muss ganz genau wissen was man machen man sagen kann //mhm// und wie man das sagen kann. Und ähm (1) da war ich schon der Meinung dass nicht nur die Sprache äh wichtig ist sondern auch äh °das- das=Schreiben° ist äh genauso wichtig oder noch wichtiger.

Against the background of a comparison with her husband's medical profession, Ms Morales-Aznar insists on that her profession is "different" and requires such a good command of the language that one "achieves a particular impact" both in speaking and "writing".⁹ In her emphasis on the fact that it is not only "what" one needs to say but also "how", she points at the difference between knowledge and skill. The right way to express oneself in business issues is only to be learned in practice, i.e. in the very situation of conversing.

Summary: Albeit nuances of differences between the three countries compared in this chapter dominant homologies are documented in the interviews cited. These homologies shall be summarized in the following.

First of all, in the accounts of all migrants whose interviews were analysed for this chapter there is a thorough orientation toward the acquisition of the receiving country's language. This may be seen as a matter of course. However, as soon as we will have included another typologically situated case group in the inquiry (see chapter 3) we will see that this language orientation is a peculiarity of those migrants who follow a career on the free market as managers etc.

Secondly in most of the interviews it is documented that language acquisition does not stop at (non-)formal learning, i.e. by taking part in language courses. Those persons who already have a good command of the country's language or even speak it as their mother-tongue are evidence for the additional need for informal learning. This is because – as is evident from both the native speakers as well as the migrants who still have to learn the country's language – in informal learning (at work or during leisure time) migrants are able to acquire skills in how one uses the language, in using the right idioms at the right place, and in speaking in a convincing manner.

As those migrants who are engaged in informally learning the legitimate usage of the country's language do so in the context of work, it is intelligible that some of them were even ready to accept positions below their level of education, just in order to acquire the insiders' use of language.

2.2 Turkey and Germany: Learning the codes of qualified local labour

Deeply connected with informally learning the insider's use of language is the topic of this and the next chapter: learning the codes of local labour. Again I will analyse the different cases country by country. However, concerning codes of labour, a clear difference has been detected between Turkey and Germany on the one hand and Canada on the other. While in all three countries familiarity with the codes of local labour is something which migrants experience as a *conditio sine qua non* for acquiring qualified labour market positions, in Canada it does not matter when this familiarity with local labour is based on experience in unqualified jobs (see chapter 2.3). In contrast to this in the cases in Turkey and Germany a relatively high level entry into the labour market is documented.

Turkey: In Turkey both interviewees who are considered for this chapter have undergone a period in which they first had to get acquainted to the expectations and standards of the Turkish labour market.

9. In chapter 3 we will find empirical evidence for Ms Morales-Aznar's assumption concerning the medical profession.

Although *Mr Sak* keeps trying to underscore his cultural proximity to Turkey, in his account we can identify a period in which he first had to get acquainted with the ‘dos and don’ts’ of Turkish business. When he came to Turkey upon an “agreement” between his country and the Istanbul Chamber of Commerce he immediately began an “internship” in the latter institution because this institution had been unknown to the Uzbek public (TRN09, Sak, 66-75):

TRN09: Türkiye’ye bindokuzyüz (.) doksan altı mart, altıncı mart günü geldim. Hala hatırımda. Orda (.) Türkiye’ye gelmemin sebebi, ticaret, İstanbul Ticaret Odası’nda staj yapmaktı. Çünkü, Özbekistan’da o zaman, ticeret, sanayi ve ticaret odası yoktu. İstanbul’da öğrenip bu işi memlekette pratiğe dökmek lazımdı. Öyle anlaşma vardı. Bu anlaşmaya göre iki kişi geldik ve staj yaptık. Ve burda İstanbul Ticaret Odası’nda staj yaparken buradaki bir kaç iş adamlarıyla tanıştık. Onlar (.) Ortaasya hakkında bizden bilgi aldılar. Yatırım yapma hususunda onlara yardımcı olduk. Ve bizim staj bitince bizim arkadaşım gitti. Ben de gidecektim zamanında. Bu iş adamlarından birisi onun firmasında çalışmamı teklif etti.

Although we are not informed about what Mr Sak has learned during the internship it is clear that he has performed so well that one of the entrepreneurs he has been in touch with during the internship offers him a job, most probably in order to make use of Mr Sak’s competencies pertaining to former Eastern block countries.

Of course at this time Mr Sak still did not have the insider’s knowledge of Turkish business. Only after his first experiences as an “economic advisor” he started to learn the important items of successful consulting (“research”, “evaluation”, “raporting”) (TRN09, Sak, 94-102):

TRN09: Genelde ben ikti... ekonomik danışmanlık vazifesi gördüm. Yatırım projeleri üzerinde çalıştım. Beşe yakın projeyi ürettim diyebilirim kendim. Gidip yatırım yatırılacak ülkelere, bölgelere gidip, yerinde bu fabrikaları araştırma, değerlendirme, sonra rapor yazma, bu benim vazifemdi. Bildiğim kadar bu firmada bunu yapacak başka adam da yoktu. Sonradan böyle sık sık araştırmalara git... gidince ben tecrübe kazandım. Yeterince. Buranın da durumunu iyi öğrenmiş oldum. Kendimi çok emin hissetmeye başladım. Çoğu zaman benim önerilerim iyi kabul gördü. Ve böyle hayat devam etti.

Mr Sak has proposed several international trade projects to his company and by elaborating these projects he has, as he states himself, “gained experience”. This experience doesn’t only pertain to the countries where he located the projects but also, as he adds on, the “situation here”. One can assume that by working in this company (and by completing the internship before) Mr Sak has learned how business in Turkey is organized, what is expected from economic advisers, what the does and don’ts in this position are. As he underpins that his “suggestions” have mostly been accepted one can also assume that this local labour experience has been crucial for his success.

Similarly to the migrant discussed above *Mr Lor* too has first worked as a consultant in a company. During this job and of course during his second, more qualified position as a chemical expert that he holds when he gives the interview, he has gained some insights into the codes of labour which were crucial for him. In the following section of the interview Mr Lor gives a rather theoretical account of some peculiarities in which his Turkish work experience differs from that back in Germany (TRN01, Lor, 317-375):

TRN01: aber (.) insgesamt ist es so, dass die Türken anders arbeiten als die Deutschen, wenn ich jetzt mal so von mir //mmh// ausgehe als Deutschen, ist natürlich eine unzulässige Verallgemeinerung, das weiss ich schon, aber was soll ich machen, so, @muss ja von irgendeinem Standpunkt ausgehen@, //@(.)@// ahm, also die Türken mehr so, ja, ein bisschen ungenauer, //mmh// um es mal so zu formulieren. Das wird dann halt, das Problem, das da ist, das wird irgendwie gelöst, na, ob das jetzt, ja mir fallen, ich kann es schlecht formulieren. Es stellt sich ein Problem, da gibt’s zwei Möglichkeiten. Wie lös ich das jetzt? Erstens, ich kann

versuchen, mich in das Problem reinzudenken (.) und zu lesen, oder zu recherchieren, ja, wie ist das zu lösen, sei es jetzt, weil es jetzt um irgendwelche gesetzlichen Regelwerke geht, oder um technische Probleme, oder sonst was. Da kann man ja immer lesen, recherchieren oder sonst was. Und sich dann ne Meinung bilden und es dann versuchen, es von Grund auf zu lösen, weil man es vielleicht nächstes Mal wieder lösen muss. //mmh// Da schafft man sich die Werkzeuge, um es beim nächsten Mal schneller zu lösen, und äh (2), ich weiss nicht, ob das jetzt auf diese Internetfirma genauso zutrifft, weil ich das damals noch nicht so gesehn hab, oder mir ist es nicht so aufgefallen, vielleicht auch, weil ich weniger Türkisch konnte @(.).@. Ahm, aber, //(schnäuzt sich)// mir fällt auf, dass die Türken, die Türken, die ich kenne und die Türken, mit denen ich zu tun habe und deren Arbeit ich beobachten kann, dass die eben nicht so arbeiten, dass sie es von Grund auf lösen und sich damit die Voraussetzung für, eigentlich, Fortschritt schaffen, damit's beim nächsten Mal schneller geht oder optimaler zu lösen versuchen, es wird halt irgendwie, es wird gefragt, über die Ecke rüber. „Weisst du, wie das geht?“ Ja, und dann sagt er: „Ja, ja, das habe ich mal so gemacht“. Und dann kriegt man irgendeinen Zettel, //mmh// auf dem schon mal @Kaffee@ getrunken wurde, also ich übertreib jetzt ein bisschen, aber, und dann macht man das so. Aber ich hab keine, also, ich, wenn ich irgend- irgendne Behördenmappe zusammenstelle, dann verlass ich mich doch nicht auf nen Zettel von irgendjemandem, sondern dann guck ich mal, was die Behörde dazu schreibt. Denn wer weiß, ob das nicht, ob dieser Zettel nicht schon zwei Jahre alt ist, und was Neues rauskam. Ja? //mmh// Also das ist ne andere Arbeitsweise. Und das Interessante ist, obwohl dann dieser Zettel, diesen Fall habe ich erlebt, outdated ist, das heißt, was da draufsteht, ist nicht mehr das, was eigentlich gefordert ist. Das macht nichts, das geht trotzdem durch, wenn man das dann der Behörde vorlegt. Also es gibt eben, auf der Behörde sitzen nämlich auch die Türken, @die es nicht so genau sehen, ja?@ //@(.).@// Und die wissen vielleicht gar nicht, was die neuen Anforderungen sind. Oder die sagen: „Ja, ok! Ist nicht so schlimm.“ Na ja, das is ne gewisse Flexibilität da, die auf der einen Seite schön ist, weil man nicht, weil man an manchen Stellen nicht gegen ne Wand fährt, wo es heisst, aber na gut, das muss so sein, auf der anderen Seite find ich das echt behindernd. //mmh// Und ähm, ok, ich hab jetzt natürlich als Wissenschaftler gearbeitet, also da ist es vielleicht sowieso nochmal, als Naturwissenschaftler. //mmh// da ist es vielleicht sowieso vorherrschend so ne Genauigkeit. Weil man es, sonst geht's gar nicht, sonst kommt man überhaupt nicht voran. Sonst geht alles schief. //mmh// Da ist kein Experiment reproduzierbar. //mmh// Ich tippe mal ab, dass das schon so einen allgemeinen Trend widerspiegelt. //mmh// Aber gut, ich mag mich auch täuschen, aber wenn ich den Elektriker sehe, den ich rufe, um mir irgendwas zu reparieren, dann glaube ich eigentlich, dass ich nicht ganz falsch liege, mit dem Trend. @(.).@ //@(.).@// Nein, also, das ist so ne wirklich andere Arbeitsmentalität. Aber wie gesagt, die (2), also, es gibt sehr viele echt gut qualifizierte Leute. Und es ist nicht so, dass man da als Deutscher herkommt und ist automatisch besser qualifiziert.

Mr Lor makes sure that his observations and conclusions on the local codes of work are not taken as being prejudiced. He underpins that he feels uncomfortable by distinguishing “Turks” from “Germans”, confines his conclusions to those people he knows and – above all – insists that there are “very many well qualified people” in Turkey who can easily compete with German experts.

However, Mr Lor has observed a striking difference between the ‘Turkish’ way of handling problems and the one he is used to as both a German socialized and a more scientifically-oriented expert: In summary, he describes that his Turkish colleagues just manage to get by those problems they face during work, e.g. when they have to prepare a file for the state administration. Doing so they rely on knowledge handed down by other colleagues who also have only just scraped through the problem. In the context of Turkey this does not, according to Mr Lor, constitute a problem, because the administration itself is not taking things too seriously. Mr Lor contrasts this to his own habits of solving problems “from the ground” and thereby “producing progress”.¹⁰

10. It is not the purpose of this paper to discuss whether Mr Lor’s observations and conclusions are valid or not. Rather we put the question of validity of the things said in brackets, as Karl Mannheim has suggested, and reconstruct what is documented in Mr Lor’s account.

As is documented in this account, Mr Lor first of all is, on the basis of his personal experience, very well aware of the peculiarities of local codes of qualified labour. Secondly he assumes these differences as irreconcilable with the codes of qualified labour in Germany. Nevertheless he accords, thirdly, some plausibility to the ‘Turkish’ way of handling problems insofar as it is – at least on short sight – successful.

Mr Lor’s insights into the codes of local labour are not confined to the peculiarities of the *modus operandi* of working; he has also gained an overview on the labour market and has reassessed his opportunities and restrictions thereon (TRN01, Lor, 216-245):

TRN01: So, und diese diesen Job gibt es in der Türkei nicht. //mmh// Weil es so ne Grundlagenforschung bei türkischen Pharma- lokalen Pharmafirmen nicht gibt, und die internationalen haben sie nicht in der Türkei. Die grossen haben das alle, aber die haben das in USA natürlich, in England, in Deutschland, Frankreich, Japan, Italien weiss ich schon gar nicht mehr, vielleicht auch mal oder so, //mmh// aber so ist das. In der Türkei gibt’s den Job nicht. Das heisst, ich war also, sprachlich hatte ich ein Handicap, ganz offensichtlich, obwohl mein Türkisch nicht schlecht war, aber trotzdem fand ich, hatte ich mit meiner Muttersprache ein Handicap und ich war quasi Berufsumsteiger, //mmh// für die war ich Anfänger. Ich kannte zwar die Pharmabranche. Aber auf dem Job, für den sie mich hätten einstellen sollen, den sie überhaupt an- den sie sozusagen im Repertoire hatten in ihrer Firma, wär ich quasi Anfänger gewesen, oder Umsteiger zumindest und das sind natürlich Bedingungen, unter denen es, zumindest für mich, nicht möglich war, en Job zu kriegen, //mmh// //mmh// ja. Es stellt sich vielleicht anders dar, wenn man (.) ähm für IT-Fachleute (.), ja, die also, Programmierer beispielsweise, die müssen nicht so viel Türkisch reden, die müssen programmieren, das ist sowieso auf Englisch. //mmh// Also vielleicht jetzt nicht grade Benutzeroberflächen, aber die wirkliche, das Programm zu schreiben, das ist das ist sowieso alles kodierte Sprache. Und da, da kommen solche Dinge wie Sprache nicht so zum Tragen. Und diese Jobs gibt es hier, genau so wie sie’s in Deutschland gibt. Das war bei mir nicht der Fall, insofern hat es nicht funktioniert. Bis ich dann langsam aber sicher gemerkt habe, dass ich vielleicht was machen sollte, oder (.), mich um en Job kümmern sollte, der möglichst na:h an dem ist, was ich bisher gemacht hab. @Das hat damals das hat nicht ewig gedauert@, bis ich das rausgefunden hat habe. Aber es war dann nicht einfach, solche Firmen zu identifizieren, die so was machen.

Mr Lor lists numerous obstacles he has experienced and/or anticipated during his search for a qualified position on the labour market. Apart from his deficiencies in the Turkish language he understands that there is not any basic research on pharmaceuticals in Turkey. In other fields he would only be recognized as a “new starter” and hence not be attractive for employers, given his limited knowledge of Turkish. Only after this experience he discovers that he has to seek a job closely connected to his previous work experience back in Germany, but not in basic research. As is evident in the following, not printed section of the interview he eventually finds a position in the development of pharmaceuticals (i.e. the preparation of marketable products).

Germany: As in Turkey, the migrants interviewed in Germany who follow management careers on the free market learn the codes of local labour in more or less qualified positions. However, whereas in Turkey only one of the migrants used his knowledge and skills which pertain to his home region (the Eastern block in the case of Mr Sak), the labour market entry of Mr Bergström and Ms Morales-Aznar, the two cases to be examined in the following, is facilitated by a certain advantage of homeland-related knowledge and skills.¹¹

11. Ms Guzman-Berg is not given place in this chapter because she entered the German labour market with an expert visa and started with a specific, highly qualified *international* position right away.

Mr Bergström is still astonished that in 1992 he was appointed manager of a company which operated in filter production in East Germany although he had only graduated from university. He there collects first experiences both in leadership and in marketing (AD08, Bergström, 253-286):

AD08: und ich hab mich einfach da beworben ich war ja bei Weitem nicht äh irgendein Leiter sondern ich war ja: n Student der gerade mit meim Studium fertig war, aber, der die Sprache ganz gut beherrschte und //mhm mhm// und (.) der gerne nach Ostdeutschland gegangen äh ist und. ich hab mich beworben und äh ich und paar andre wurden (.) eingestellt, //mhm// meine Aufgabe wars diese Siebproduktion zu leiten und, //mhm// da stand ich eines Tages im Sommer zwo- 1992 ((atmet ein)) hatte 15 (.) Ostdeutsche (.) Arbeiter in blauen Anzügen vor mir, (.) die alle mindestens zehn Jahre älter warn als ich //mhm// ((atmet ein)) äh und äh sollte nun diese diese Truppe in irgendeiner Art und Weise leiten, ((atmet ein)) und äh=ich (.) habe denen gleich gesagt dass ich also von dern Produktion überhaupt //mhm// keine Ahnung habe ((atmet ein)) (w=äh) dass es aber nichts bringen wird wenn die (.) gegen mich oder mich dort versuchen rauszukicken weil das Unternehmens=sieht sowieso nich besonders gut aus und //mhm// wir werden das nur (.) zusammen da schaffen wenn überhaupt. //mhm// Und ich glaube diese diese Offenheit und diese sozusagen ich bin nicht jemand Großes, ich b- bin aber hier und wir s- wir müssen das zusammen machen äh (.) das hat da mh- (.) ganz gut gewirkt und ((atmet ein)) wir äh-b-äh (.) die Aufgabe hieß eigentlich (1) guck dir doch mal an, was is das für ein Produkt, wie sieht der Markt aus, hat dieses Produkt überhaupt ein Zukunft? Äh was müssen wa hier machen? Äh- ein (.) die Strategie von dem Schweden war einfach zu sagen es dauert Ewigkeiten ein ein Geschäftszweig aufzubauen; zumachen kann man in zehn Minuten. //mhm// Aber, hier ist was über Jahre aufgebaut wovon ich zwar keine Ahnung habe, aber bevor wirs=zumachen oder darüber nachdenken muss jemand sich das zumindest angucken ob das was bringen könnte. //mhm// Das war im Grunde meine Aufgabe und ich habe da (.) ((atmet ein)) ja einige Monate damit verbracht in einem: ja in einem Wartburg was damals mir zur Verfügung stand äh (.) mit einem: technisch mit einem Techniker im Grunde genommen hab ich die Kundenliste genommen und bin die ganzen ostdeutschen Städten hier abgefährt und hab mit den ehemaligen Betrieben von-d viele von denen gab es zu dem Zeitpunkt gar nicht mehr. ((atmet ein)) bin den einfach abgefährt und hab den gefragt äh=ob die gefragt ob die überhaupt Interesse:, an diesen Produkten noch mal habn //°mhm°// und wie das aussehen könnte und so weiter und dann hab ich einen ((atmet ein)) Bericht (.) darüber (.) geschrieben (.)

The interviewee recalls his first day in the company when he stood in front of 15 blue collar workers, far older than him and socialized in the Eastern Block. He managed this difficult situation by underpinning that all share the same fate and therefore have to cooperate. It is clear from his narration that Mr Bergström had anticipated hostility toward him, the youngster from Sweden, and that he had developed a strategy to cope with this supposed hostility.

In addition to this leadership experience Mr Bergström also makes his first steps in marketing by visiting all previous customers of the company in order to check if there is still a market. A third item of his growing experience is reporting, although this reporting does not necessarily provide him with inside knowledge of the codes of labour valid in (Eastern) Germany but rather with the Swedish habits.

In the background of these opportunities to get to know the local codes of labour lies Mr Bergström's attractiveness as a German speaking Swede who is able to communicate both with his Swedish boss (and to anticipate his expectations) as well as with German workers and customers. This facilitates Mr Bergström's access to a highly qualified position although he is not experienced yet.

Some relation to the country of origin is also important for *Ms Morales-Aznar's* first job in Germany. Although she – as we can recall from chapter 2.1 – was ready to take up any job which would provide her with contact to German speaking people she somehow found a job in the press department of an electronics company (AD14, Morales-Aznar, 302-317):

AD14: Und dann mit dem Schreiben, (.) in diesem Unternehmen das war ein Unternehmen für Elektronik //mhm// ähm (.) sie hatten äh HiFi äh Geräte, ähm äh (.) designed und auch äh hergestellt und //mhm// produziert ((atmet ein)) und sie hatten auch eine Abteilung für äh Marketing, für Vertrieb und für Presse. ((atmet ein)) und ähm in der ersten Zeit haben sie (uns) dann in die Presseabteilung da geschickt so nach dem Motto ja w- wenn wir noch was mit Portugal da haben da habn wir da jemanden, (.) //@(.).@// äh (.) der sich darum kümmern kann, ((atmet ein)) ja und äh (.) (das) kann ich sagen, (.) das hatte mit meinem Beruf gar nichts zu tun, ähm: in diesem Unternehmen zu arbeiten, aber (.) ich habe sehr viel gelernt mit Menschen umzugehe:n ich hab () ein Gefühl (.) äh bekommen wie (.) deutsche (.) Personen mit einem Ausländer umgehen, //mhm// und ähm (.) da konnt ich mich auch ähm (.) ja (.) mit den andern unterhalten, mal die Meinung von andern äh auch erfragen und konnte (.) sehn wie wie sich dann so eine Gruppe in einem Unternehmen auch entwickelt und wie das- was da abgeht. //mhm// in in in einm Unternehmen; und gleichzeitig hab ich auch ganz viel gelernt

On the basis of her Portugese background Ms Morales-Aznar is send to the press department where she is then asked to translate documents and brochures on the company's products into Portugese (as we learn from another part of the interview, lines 366-410, see chapter 2.1). This job in the press department gives the interviewee the opportunity to "learn how to get along with people", to "see how German persons treat foreigners" and to observe how a "group in a company develops". Although this job has not had any connection with her field of expertise (law) she concludes that she "has learned quite a lot".

Ms Morales-Aznar's case is a little different from that of Mr Bergström insofar as she gains her experience in the local codes of work outside her field of expertise. However, she will soon discover that she is going to change tracks and start a career in a bank where she can positively draw on the experiences she has made in the electronic devices company.

Summary: In the typologically situated case groups we have identified certain homologies concerning the acquisition of the codes of local labour between Germany and Turkey. In all cases examined, migrants find a rather high-level entry into the labour market, though sometimes outside their field of expertise. Both in Turkey and in Germany we have found cases for which the specific home country of the respective migrant advances his or her attractiveness on the labour market.

In the accounts of the interviewees different details of the local codes of labour are documented. First of all they learn the ways of communication (be it with colleagues or with subaltern). But knowledge of and skills in the appropriate ways of handling problems, of researching, reporting and presenting are also more or less implicit points narrated by the migrants. This is especially important because, if one contrasts these cases and those in Canada, the first local work experience gained in Germany and Turkey is already based on a considerably high level whereas in Canada, as the following chapter will show, it is not the level of work experience that matters but the sheer fact that one has worked in Canada.

At this point one again has to keep in mind that, although the case groups compared in this chapter are typologically situated in a similar way, the migrants in Turkey are provided with a rather limited legal access to the labour market whereas in Germany we could only include migrants with a legal labour market access equal to native born people. That is, in Germany there were not any cases of migrants with subordinate legal access who have succeeded to follow a management career in the free market. This shows that in Turkey it only causes problems if one has only subordinate legal access to the labour market (or even none at all) whereas in Germany the lack of legal access holds migrants completely back from using their knowledge and skills in qualified management positions.

2.3 *Canada: Accepting unqualified jobs for the sake of local work experience*

Local work experience is the „catch 22” which migrants face when they come to Canada. This has been underscored by Oliver Schmidtke in his recent paper on the cases in Canada. This finding can be further validated by comparison with the cases in Turkey and Germany. Whereas in the latter countries we did not find any management career on the free market which started from the scratch, i.e. in unqualified jobs, the three migrants who finally turned out to be successful in their profession in Canada went through times of employment in unqualified segments of labour.

Mr Fagan, the manager from South Africa, does not make any effort to hide the embarrassment he felt when he came to Canada and had to realize his former work experience did not count for anything (ACAN07, Fagan, 205-223):

ACAN07:Um, the first, when I was trying to find a job here, it was so frustrating, it's similar to what these kids get coming out of school, you know, you don't have any local experience, well, "No, I just got off the boat." @(.)@

I: @(.)@

ACAN07:So you can't get a job because you don't have any local experience, but I don't get any local experience because they won't give me a job. So, that is just why I eventually settled for whatever I could get just to start getting work, as with a lot of friends I know, it was take what you can get at first, at least you've got an income and you can pay the rent and you can star- it's always easier to find a job when you have a job it seems, when you don't have a job it's a troublesome task. //mmh// I found going for interviews and that here was, I think a lot of it was the differential from coming from a position of respect where I had 300 plus people working for me and I was in a senior position, to these interviews which ended up being for \$10 an hour menial jobs, where they were interacting with me as though I was (2) stupid, I don't know, as if I was @less cognitively able than wanted@. They'd explain the most simple things to me and I wanted to say, "Look, I know all of this, I'll do it, it's OK." But there was this insistence that this was how it had to be done. //mmh// So @(.)@ that was a little boring, trying to get through that,

The degrading experience of being interviewed for a job for "\$10 an hour" whereas one had been in command of 300 people back home is at the core of Mr Fagan's first experiences in Canada. This degradation did not only involve a poor salary but went as far as to misjudge him as being too "stupid" to understand his "menial job".

When Mr Fagan extempores and points to "this insistence that this was how it had to be done", although he knew "all of this", it gives us further insights into the specificities of Canadian work experience: He learns here that it is important for his boss that the task is accomplished not in one way or the other but in just that way "how it had to be done" according to the boss. In spite of the proclaimed tolerance of Canadian society this is evidence for some rigidity as concerns the local codes of labour.

In a later part of the interview Mr Fagan takes up this topic again and elaborates on the "little idiosyncrasies of Canadian culture" (ACAN07, Fagan, 439-458):

ACAN07:see there are a lot of them about different countries now, and even though we speak the same language, it helped tremendously to know some of the little idiosyncrasies of Canadian culture. So doing some homework and doing some research made a big difference. And having a contact, I mean we were lucky my brother was here, but he wasn't in the same city and that, so, um, but even that, at least if I wasn't sure of the etiquette of how something worked I'd phone him up and say, "What should I do?" For instance when I applied for a job, and I'd wait to hear back, well if you wait to hear back you'll wait a long time, but if you're the person phoning saying "How's my application coming along?" follo-

wing up, employers like that because it shows initiative, but in South Africa, employers didn't like that because you were bothering them @(..)@

I: @(..)@

ACAN07: Just learning the, even just learning the difference between what they perceive as a resume here and what we perceive as a CV in the rest of the world, you know, we wouldn't hesitate to put a little personal information on there, whereas here the confidentiality issues are a lot stricter, and, you don't say that "I'm married," and that's private //mmh// So learning to change how you approach things from the one culture and looking at the differences in the culture.

Issues of the "etiquette of how something worked" are crucial, and Mr Fagan is happy to have informants (his brother) who give him advice. The interviewee experiences the peculiarities of the local codes of work both as different (in the case of the follow-up calls on job applications) and as "a lot stricter" (the dos and don'ts of resumes).

Hence the local work experience Mr Fagan gains in these unqualified positions consists of both content knowledge and procedural knowledge. Learning the Canadian "etiquette" is not enough for successful labour market entrance. The degradation Mr Fagan faced when starting his first job was also intended to show him that he as a newcomer has to strictly follow the way "how it had to be done". This subordination of the migrant seems to be crucial for successful labour market inclusion.¹²

Eventually Mr Fagan succeeds in working his way up. Customers of a factory for which he worked as a sales agent (an underqualified rather than an unqualified position) offered him a management post (ACAN07, Fagan, 223-233):

ACAN07: I guess another example I always tell of is the factory I worked in Calgary. I, um, when I first got to Calgary the job I got really quickly was a sales job in an industrial place that was selling everything from grinding wheels to parts for machines and insides sales on the phone, and, um, I was there just about a year when one of my clients at this factory, offered me a, because they knew my background, I had chatted to them. I went in for an interview and they had some problems and I said sure, you know, I'll take it on so it was nice to get into a management role, you know, and it went really well and we got rid of some of the troublemakers in the factory and hired a bunch more people and the production went up tremendously, I think we tripled in like 18 months.

The educational "background" of Mr Fagan only counted because he could communicate it in the frame of a job in Canada. One has to assume that his new employers otherwise would not have given him any credit on the basis of which he could show his potential at all. On the other hand this employer does not even hesitate to ask Mr Fagan, then a salesman, to take up a both different and higher position in his own factory. In a way this may be evidence for very good *vertical permeability* combined with restricted horizontal permeability (or rather: *horizontal impermeability* in the sense of the transfer from one national labour market to the other).

In the following Mr Fagan does not only compare his wage at the first job with that one which he received in the management position in Calgary. He also stresses the fact that there he had finally been able to regain his former level of work again (ACAN07, Fagan, 172-176):

ACAN07: and within the first two years in Calgary, I'd say our income together was probably four times what it was when we were here //mmh// just because we could apply our skills more appropriately //mmh// so I got a job managing a factory, manufacturing plant, which was similar to what I'd been doing and it worked really well,

12. This reminds us of other ritual degradation ceremonies with which novices are introduced into career paths leading to higher positions, e.g. in the army or even in craftwork.

Included in this statement is his wife who was also able to resume her professional work and could even start her own business.

A case quite similar to that of Mr Fagan is the interview with *Milagros Palacios*, the migrant from Peru. She also stresses the difference between graduating with a “masters in economics” and then having to work in a “cafeteria” when she came to Canada, only in order to gain “Canadian experience” (28) (ACAN09, Palacios, 13-21):

ACAN09:Um:m, before I came here I have a baccalaureate in Industrial Engineering, and I have a masters in Economics. //wow// And when I came here, I thought, well, it's going to be a new experience, let's try and it was very difficult for almost, two years, I was trying to find a job in my career, or my expertise, my field of expertise. So, before those two years, I was working at different things. I was working as a Spanish tutor, I was working in a cafeteria, I was working in many many many places. //mm// So, but fortunately I found an internship. So I decided to do an internship in a think tank. The name is the **Fraser institute**. And I started to do an internship there. //mm// And after a year they offered me a full time position. And right now **I am working as a research economist at the Fraser Institute.**

Among the jobs which Ms Palacios did were qualified ones (“Spanish tutor”) but also those which are not even worth mentioning as she “was working at different things”. In this case she does not really elaborate if having “Canadian experience” made a difference when she applied for the internship at Fraser Institute. However even this internship was in a sense an unqualified position with high potentials for upgrading. Finally it turned out to be the most important step for gaining a qualified job on the labour market in which Ms Palacios could perform in her own field of expertise.

Before Ms Palacios found the internship position in the Fraser Institute she had also thought about working as an industrial engineer. However, the “very tough competition” in this field and the professional regulations to be met if one wants to become an engineer in Canada motivated her to seek a position in the field of her master’s degree in economics (ACAN09, Palacios, 284-295):

ACAN09:So I thought, no I will find something with my masters in economics. And because it is not a regulated, it's not a regulated career- profession, because in Canada there is a lot of regulated and unregulated professions. //yeah// For example engineering, doctors, nurses, these are regulated. //mm// So I think, oh no, this is not regulated, so this will be a lot easier. Because it is up to the employer- if they want to hire you, //mm// or not. Okay, you don't have to go to a board, or an association, to say, hey, Milagros is an engineer and she can work here. To go for my second, my masters. //oh// So, I was Google, you know like, okay let's think about different institutes that can do research or something like that. And first of all I sent some resumes to Uvic to find a job as a teacher, you know like, assistant professor or whatever. And actually they call me, //mm// twice, yeah for interviews or something. Um, which were great, you know if I could stay here close to my family. But then I decided, I should go to an internship, somebody told me it's a good way to have Canadian experience. So I found the Fraser Institute,

From this section of the interview it is evident that Ms Palacios used the time she spent working in the cafeteria and in other unqualified jobs by making inquiries into the Canadian qualified labour market circumstances. The unqualified jobs are only accepted as a provisional means of earning money. Milagros Palacios’ career ambitions are only postponed but not abandoned.

She then avoids the obstacles of getting accepted as an engineer by “a board, or an association” and starts searching for a position as an economist. When her first job interviews for university positions did not prove successful she changed her strategy and looked for low-paid but qualified (and qualifying) positions in the context of an “internship”. This strategy is

surely a result of the social capital she has acquired in Canada. These social networks are apparently situated on a higher educational level and maybe even in the field of economics. It is surely not the ‘close tie’ to family members which provides the information that an internship is “a good way to have Canadian experience”.

The internship Ms Palacios finally found at Fraser Institute may be compared to the “sales job” Mr Fagan occupied during his career in Canada. Both positions are below the original qualification of these migrants. However they are both situated in their original field of expertise and promise a career. In this sense these jobs should be termed *underqualified* rather than *unqualified*.

In the case of Ms Palacios – similar to that of Mr Fagan – even the entrance to such a low paid underqualified position turns out to be difficult (ACAN09, Palacios, 302-311):

ACAN09: Actually, I applied twice; the first time, I was rejected @(.)@. //@oh@// But it is because they receive a lot of, //of course// and at that time my English wasn't very good. It was an interview by phone, so it was very, very tough for me. Because you don't understand what they say, and you answer in a weird, you have a weird answer. So the first time I was rejected. But the second time, I applied the next summer, because I remember I apply in 2003, and then I apply in 2004, and they accept me, in the second time. //mm// And I said, okay, I will go to Vancouver for four months, because the internship was for four months, and it is going to be like a trade off. I know that the pay is going to be awful, and that there is a lot of disadvantages economically, //mm// but I know after that, I will have my chance, perhaps. My chance will increase.

The job interview “by phone” proves to be even more difficult than face-to-face interviews, as it challenges the English language skills of Ms Palacios. Although she had graduated from a bilingual school back in Peru and although she had already been in Canada for a while she failed in the first interview. Only after one further year of getting used to the English spoken in Canada she could succeed with her application. Here again it is documented how important it is to acquire not only knowledge in the grammar of the language of the country but also the accepted way of using this language both in listening and in speaking (see chapter 2.1).

A further point evident in this section of the interview refers to the economic and financial circumstances of the internship. Ms Palacios is willing to accept this position although she is aware of the low “pay” and of the need of moving “to Vancouver for four months”. One can assume that her family circumstances allow her to undergo these difficulties for the time being: She hasn't got a partner or any children to care for, and she has only to leave her parents back in Victoria, a town nearby. Whereas these circumstances remain implicit, this migrant explicitly points to the promises of this internship, i.e. to the “trade off” and to “my chance”.

Ms Palacios' internship is eventually extended to one year, a year in which she has the opportunity to get to know two different branches of the Fraser Institute (ACAN09, Palacios, 322-328):

ACAN09: For example when you are on an internship, you work on a specific project, okay. Most of the projects are, like, four month projects. //mmh// So I started with one boss for four months during the summer of 2004. //mmh// And then I continued working with this guy for two more months. And then another project came up, but it was for a different project. //yeah// And then I started to work with my boss. So, I work in the fiscal studies department. Because the **Fraser Institute** has like different branches; they have, like, education, they have health, they have fiscal policy, and environment. I started working in the environment area, and then I jumped into the fiscal policy area.

As work in the Fraser Institute seems to be project-based, Ms Palacios acquires internal expertise and experience in different subjects from “environment” to “fiscal policy”. This internship is certainly not as formal and regulated as a management trainee programme (I will elaborate on that in the next chapter), but it still provides the migrant with the opportunity to

make her way from an underqualified to a qualified position. After her first year in the institute she was offered a “full time position” (20) as a research economist.

Henrik Schwerdtfeger, the German-Swedish manager, follows steps of labour market inclusion quite similar to Ms Palacios’. Before I investigate the narration of his career in Canada I wish to refer to a section of the interview in which Mr Schwerdtfeger theoretically reflects on decisive as well as less important factors in his labour market inclusion (ACAN23, Schwerdtfeger, 334-348):

- I: So then, now they recognize that you have a Bachelor; do you put that on your resume?
- ACAN23: No, I put that I have a Masters, because I have a Masters. //yeah//
- I: So you put that on your resume. So when you are applying for jobs, does that make a difference? To have that on your resume?
- ACAN23: Yeah, they recognize it and they see it, but (..)
- I: Was it worthwhile to do it?
- ACAN23: That? It was not worthwhile to do it, because I mean, it doesn't matter. I think the only job that would require a proper transcript is the government, uh the only employer. And apart from that. No, it is just, the new job I have, starting the 4th of January //yeah// it didn't require that at all. They said, “oh, okay, you have a Masters, okay fine, what are your Canadian work experience?” //okay// That's what they go for. //okay// So they've got the work experience; and of course, of got the work experience now, but two years ago I didn't have the work experience that caused some problems. That's why I had to go to the restaurant and stuff?

The migrant first of all makes a clear difference between “government” jobs and those on the free market. Quoting his new employer, Mr Schwerdtfeger underscores that on the free market certificates are less valid than “Canadian work experience”. Interestingly he then does not refer to his previous experience in (under-)qualified positions but points to the “restaurant” where he had found his first job in Canada. As is documented in this transcript, Mr Schwerdtfeger here takes over the perspective of employers for whom it is not important on which level the work experience has been acquired but in which country. It has to be further investigated if Mr Schwerdtfeger approves this perspective or only takes it into account.

In the following section of the interview the migrant refers to the restaurant job mentioned above (ACAN23, Schwerdtfeger, 195-202):

- I: Cool, so then you started at the Lindenhoff?
- ACAN23: Yeah, it was a busy time, the @hunters festival@ was just going on, I think it was called //@(.).@// //R2: and that was November// Yeah it was crazy with all the Christmas stuff after that.
- I: And had you done serving work before?
- ACAN23: No. Well, yeah, I worked in a bar, but I didn't do, I never served food before. But I found that out pretty quickly. //okay// No it was a decent job, we lived on our own, we lived around the corner.

As is documented in this transcript Mr Schwerdtfeger does not experience the “serving work” as degrading. He views it in the framework of his new life with his partner (“we lived on our own”) and finds it “decent”.

Further evidence that Mr Schwerdtfeger does not only take into account the perspective of employers but in a way shares it, can be found in the narration of his first application for a qualified position (ACAN23, Schwerdtfeger, 183-193):

- ACAN23: Yeah, I had, Enterprise rent-a-car, I had had an interview with them, //so that's related to your degree, or// yeah, it was actually upper-level management //oh, okay//. A decent job, it was my first interview though, and I certainly found it was not the right time at that point. It should have been the third or something. //okay// At the time I wanted that job, and the interview didn't really go well. And with a bit of preparation I could have easily probably passed an interview, but, whatever, it didn't happen. So I didn't pass that interview. //yeah, yeah//
- I: So was it language or?

ACAN23: No, it was just some silly questions that I, I, yeah, point out three weaknesses and, uh, silly stuff, but, uh (...) //yeah, just weren't ready at that point// Yeah, just more study of vocabulary at that point.

According to Mr Schwerdtfeger's experience it had not been the lack of professional experience which turned out to be an obstacle during this first interview, but his naivety concerning some rather procedural interview requirements, combined with a lack of language skills. Both the language problem and the migrant's astonishment when he was asked to "point out three weaknesses" refer to a lack of Canadian (work) experience. This is also the conclusion drawn by Mr Schwerdtfeger himself who finds that "it was not the right time at that point" to have this interview. Rather it should "have been the third" interview.

With the Canadian work experience acquired on the unqualified job in the restaurant the migrant then is able to find a position "more in my area, marketing". However, this first position, though it is on a higher level than the internship accepted by Ms Palacios, is still not a permanent one. Nonetheless Mr Schwerdtfeger accepts the "three month contracts" offered to him (ACAN23, Schwerdtfeger, 241-250):

ACAN23: Yeah, so I quit my job and found another job, more in my area, marketing. And with **Sun Microsystems**. //yeah// It was one of the (computer?) //okay// And, um, it was good. It was- because Sun Corporate, Sun didn't really finance it's marketing very well, my boss could only give me three month contracts at a time, depending on how the business was doing //okay// . So, I can only- I have three month contracts, but, and I fulfilled two of them, but after fulfilling the second one, I found another job with **JDS Uniphase**. //okay// Uh, which was a permanent position, and their pay, //also in marketing?// Actually, it was in customer service. But what was interesting was that it connected me with my education but that I was taking care of middle and upper European customers.

After the step into the qualified position "with Sun Microsystems" it seems to be easy for Mr Schwerdtfeger to further pursue his career finding a job with "JDS Uniphase" which is "permanent" and presumably better paid. This job – alike the one Mr Schwerdtfeger will start only short time after the interview – also offers him the opportunity to take advantage of his foreign language skills, catering for customers throughout Europe.

As is documented in the narration of his career Mr Schwerdtfeger, as the other migrants analysed, follows a path into the labour market which starts from unqualified jobs, followed by underqualified or unpermanent and badly paid positions up to positions in which he can fully perform his professional capabilities. He never experiences any problem concerning the fact that he had previously worked in unqualified jobs. Rather for Canadian employers such "Canadian work experience", no matter what kind it is, is an asset or rather a prerequisite for hiring Mr Schwerdtfeger. He himself is quite aware of the importance of Canadian work experience and underscores that it had been helpful to "build some references here in Canada, from former jobs" (634-4).

Summary: As is documented in all three cases analysed in this chapter, foreign managers' labour market inclusion in Canada requires Canadian work experience no matter what kind it is. Hence, these migrants start with unqualified jobs by which they can both sustain themselves financially and acquire the required work experience. This (ritualistic) subordination of the migrant seems to be crucial for successful labour market inclusion. It is also important that the migrant willingly accepts this degradation and in a way even approves of it. Given some Canadian work experience, employers then turn out to be ready to hire these migrants for positions in their field of expertise. However, these positions are either underqualified or low paid and non-permanent. Only after having gone through these steps into the labour market migrants are able to find positions which are fully adequate to their education titles.

To put this path of labour market inclusion in more theoretical words, the steps from unqualified jobs over underqualified positions to adequate occupations reveal a very opportune vertical permeability combined with restricted transnational horizontal permeability.

2.4 Germany: Formal further education in connection with qualified labour market positions

In Germany, as I have shown in chapter 2.2, migrants who follow career paths as managers find an entrance into the labour market on a considerably high level though not always in their original field of expertise. Whereas for the respective migrants in Canada the formal aspect of having acquired local work experience is decisive for labour market inclusion, the narrative accounts of the migrants analysed in Germany (and in Turkey) provide evidence that professional experience is acquired during the first *qualified* jobs. In addition to the informal ways of learning the codes of labour, in Germany (but not in Turkey) we also find different facets of formal further education. I will investigate these experiences of formal further education taking into account the cases of Ms Morales-Aznar, Mr Bergström and Ms Guzman-Berg.

Elvira Morales-Aznar, the law expert from Portugal, starts working in the law department of the Dresdner Bank where she can continue her efforts in acquiring the knowledge and skills required to pursue a decent career in Germany (Morales-Aznar, AD 14, 426-448):

AD14: U::nd dann gleich hier nach Hambu::rg und 93 ähm hatte ich dann in der Bank angefangen in der Rechtsabteilung und, (.) in der Bank ähm (.) hatte ich dann ähm (.) mit dem mit der Banksausbildung dann angefangen alles was mit Bank und mit (.) Wirtschaft und äh ((atmet ein)) äh den ganzen Berei:chen die:: °ähm äh° für unsere Arbeit (.) wichtig sind, ((atmet ein)) (.) hab ich dann in der Bank (.) gelernt. (.) //mhm// (.) Entweder war Selbststudium oder, ähm (.) auch über Seminare, //mhm// und (über) verschiedene Kurse, Also ich war ja immer sehr ähm daran interessiert mich weiterzubilden, //mhm// (1) und das hab ich nach und nach also zuerst war natürlich dann diese juristische: äh Sprache sehr wichtig weil //mhm// wenn man in der Rechtsabteilung anfängt ja gut ((atmet ein)) ich hatte ein ein Jurastudium aber in einem andren Land, //mhm// (.) u:nd äh natürlich sind die Gesetze nicht überall gleich. ((atmet ein)) Aber es gibt Gesetze die nicht so weit äh voneinander entfernt sind. //mhm// u:nd das ist bei uns der Fall mit äh (.) äh Zivilrecht zum Beispiel in n bei uns in Portugal sehr ähnlich ((atmet ein)) sowohl in Portugal das Zivilrecht als auch äh das deutsches- äh Zivilrecht stammen aus dem römischen //mhm// und deshalb für mich äh (.) war ja immer der Vergleich da und da konnte ich ganz schnell mich wieder (.) ä:hm einfinden, und äh in der Lernphase () (1) ja. manchmal war das schwierig aber, (.) ansonsten wenn man die kleinen Erfolge gesehen hat hat das Spaß gemacht auch. //mhm mhm// Festzustellen oh, (.) das weiß ich doch alles und //@.(.)@// (.) @man musste dann nur natürlich au immer ähm (.) das (.) deutsche Wo:rt@ (.) mit dem (.) portugiesischen Wo:rt ähm //mhm// na die- i-identifizieren und dann weiß man oder hat man dann genau gewu- ach ja natürlich. das und das und das is das.

Ms Morales-Aznar improves her knowledge and skills both by studying by herself (“Selbststudium”) and by attending “different courses”. It is important to note that the bank employs her without evaluating the nature and appropriateness of her academic certificate. On the one hand the academic certificate is formally taken as institutionalized cultural capital at face value. On the other hand the bank allows Ms Morales-Aznar to carry on improving her knowledge and skills inside and outside the bank. Although she does not undergo a formal bank education (“Banksausbildung”) as one might assume following her own wording, this “learning phase” apparently is approved by the employer, too. In the next case, Mr Bergström, we will find more evidence for this attitude of the bank.

If one goes into the contents of the informal and formal further education, it is evident that Ms Morales-Aznar does not only have to compensate for language differences or for juridical knowledge she did not acquire during her studies in Portugal. An important part of her learn-

ing activities is dedicated to “all that has to do with bank and (.) economy and all those areas which (.) are important for our work”. Hence, *compensative learning* is accompanied by *additive learning*. On the basis of this “learning phase” Ms Morales-Aznar is then able to “make her way up to a payment” which is rather high.

Compensative learning has not been an issue for *Mr Bergström*, the Swedish economist, when he started working in the Dresdner Bank. He had already made some experience as the manager of a Swedish company which invested in old industries in the Eastern part of Germany. On the occasion of a “fair” in Dresden he receives information on the management trainee programme of the Dresdner Bank and sends his CV to the respective bank (Bergström AD08, 305-330):

AD08: ... und hatte da ((atmet ein)) **auf einer Messe mich bei der** Dresdner Bank erkundigt (.) //mhm// und ähm dann das Signal bekommen dass es da sogenannte Traineeplätze gibt. ich weiß nicht ob Sie das kennen //mhm mhm// das is () Quereinsteiger (und) ((atmet ein)) und hatte einfach dort eine blinde Bewerbung sag=ich=mal dort losgeschickt wurde zum Gespräch eingeladen und hatte dann das Angebot nach äh (.) nach Dresden mhm zur Dresdner Bank zu kommen. //mhm mhm// Wie s- is so manchmal so is gleichzeitig ein Angebot (.) ein sehr sehr schönes Angebot in Schweden bekommen bei einer großen Firma dorthin zu gehen ((atmet ein)) äh aber, hab mich letztendlich für Dresden dann entschieden. Äh weil ich sagte das ist Deutschland das ist was andres als Schweden. Äh (.) ich habe deutsch studiert ich: (.) habe meine Freundin in Dresden und ähm. Fand das unheimlich spannend im Ausland zu sein. Dresdner Bank war für mich ein (.) renommiertes Unternehmen äh wo ich wüsste wenn ich mich da wenn ich da gut arbeite hab ich da gute Aufstiegschancen ((atmet ein)) und äh Bank äh (.) dacht ich äh liegt mir gut ich habe immer ne Faszination für Geld gehabt //mhm// ((atmet ein)) äh auch als kleiner Junge hab ich da immer n Kassenbuch geführt von jeder kleine Einnahme von meiner Oma äh zwei Euro () heute bekommen) hab ich die auf n Einnahmenseite und wenn ich was gekauft habe auf der Aus- ((atmet ein)) und ähm (.) ohne geizig zu sein aber ne Faszination für Geld und die Vermehrung vor allem von Geld und ((atmet ein)) deswegen also Bank dacht ich, Mensch das könnte was für Dich sein und ähm (.) ja. mein Studium passte ja dazu und und so weiter und der Standort passte auch. ((atmet ein)) Und äh ich wollte eigentlich weg von dem kleinen äh schwedischen Unternehmen was sowieso nicht da seriös auf mich wirkte. (.) Und habe da:nn das angenommen in April 1993 als Trainee bei der Dresdner Bank in Dresden angefangen.

His application for a management trainee programme for people with academic degrees different from accountancy („career changer” – “Quereinsteiger“) turns out to be successful. Mr Bergström prefers this position to other opportunities offered to him by a company back in Sweden. It is not only his then-girlfriend who had been important for this decision but also his motivation to be “abroad” and his high career expectation (“very good upgrading opportunities”). But highest priority is given to his own “fascination for money” dating back to his childhood.

Mr Bergström does not even mention any difficulty in securing this management trainee position. As is evident in the following section of the transcript, the bank only takes into consideration the formal academic qualification of applicants and does not expect them to be experts for bank issues. Rather the bank promises to “further educate” its new employees while granting them a decent salary (Bergström AD08, 366-382):

AD08: und ähm in Dresden hab ich dann (.) wie gesagt gewohnt von 1993 bis 1999 ((atmet ein)) in der Zeit ähm (1) sehr viel gearbeitet. Äh es wurde viel von den Trainees verlangt wir warn ja ((atmet ein)) Studierte ähm für (.) Bankverhältnisse, recht gut bezahlte ((atmet ein)) Leute die eigentlich noch nicht so viel konn-ten wir haben ja keine Banklehre gehabt und so //mhm// sondern man musste uns ja im Grunde auch (.) weiter ausbilden //mhm// wir haben zwar mit unsern Uni-seugnissen und so weiter signalisiert dass wir was drauf haben //mhm// aber, nicht unbedingt von der täglichen Bankgeschäft. //mhm mhm// Äh ich gehörte zu denjenigen die eine Ausbildung hatten die ja zumindest in die richtige Richtung

ging, aber da warn auch Leute die Theologie studiert haben oder, ((atmet ein)) Sprachwissenschaftler also reine Sprachwissenschaftler °oder° (.) ganz andre Leute=äh Geschichtsleute Matheleute. //mhm// und äh das hat mir gezeigt dass die Bank damals einfach Leute genommen hatten die (.) die mit ihren Studienzeugnissen mit ihrem Auftreten gezeigt haben wir können was für die Bank leisten auch wenn wir jetzt nicht (.) äh das Einmaleins des Bankgeschäfts sofort beherrschen.

In the case of the management trainee programme, further education is not only an additional service of the bank but a prerequisite for the inclusion of new staff into its organization. In the perception of Mr Bergström, the bank only formally acknowledges the academic qualification of applicants and assumes that they “are well equipped”. Apart from this the bank takes responsibility for providing its trainees with all knowledge in the “everyday bank business” and gives them time to acquire the basic skills needed.

In doing so the bank does not differentiate between different academic qualifications (as was already evident in the case of Ms Morales-Aznar). It even does not seem to make a difference between foreign born and native applicants. The entrance into the bank is quite easy, but it is followed by “high expectations” of the bank and “hard work” to be accomplished by the trainees.

Whereas Ms Morales-Aznar’s further education has not been organized within the frame of a programme, Mr Bergström profited from the management trainee programme. Subsequently he starts in a higher position in the bank and is able to pursue a career which is slightly more successful than that of Ms Morales-Aznar.

If one further compares Mr Bergström’s case with that of Ms Morales-Aznar, important features of formalized further education become evident: In both cases further education is closely connected to a career which has already started in an organization of the labour market. That is, both migrants do not take part in further education as a means for entering the labour market on a qualified level, but they seek to further develop their qualification with this further education.

In addition, Mr Bergström and Ms Morales-Aznar do not only take part in further education after having entered the labour market. The further education courses themselves are closely connected to their job and usually are organized by their employers. That means that the knowledge and skills acquired during further education can be assumed to meet the expectations of employers.¹³ However, as these educative courses are organized by the employing firm it remains to be seen if the knowledge and skills provided are useful (and acknowledged as cultural capital) by other employers, too. Interesting enough neither Ms Morales-Aznar nor Mr Bergström have changed their employer in the meantime.

In the next case, that of *Ms Guzman-Berg*, further education is only partly organized by the employer himself. Different from Mr Bergström and Ms Morales-Aznar who work as bank managers in general, without any special reference to their home country, Ms Guzman-Berg who used to be a lawyer in the field of tax law back home in Brazil, was first hired by a consulting company as an expert for Latin American tax law. However, it was not only the fact that this field offered her rather limited career opportunities but also her general enthusiasm for (further) education which made Ms Guzman-Berg especially keen on improving her knowledge and skills.

Before she even came to Germany she had decided to study a different law system at a university in Belgium. Although she was accepted as a student by the Catholic University of

13. In chapter 4 I will elaborate on cases in Canada in which further education does not meet the expectations of employers and turns out to be as expensive as useless.

Leuwen (“Louvain”), she then changed her mind and followed her then boyfriend to Hamburg (Guzman-Berg, AD03, 340-368):

AD03: und dann war ich mich
entschieden ich wollt sogar ein volles Jahr (jetzt doch) in Ausland (.) studiert. (.)
//mhm// Ne (.) nicht nur wegen mein Ehemann das ich da getroffen a-aber (.)
weil hat mir gefallen also (.) andre Jurasytem zu lernen un- ((atmet ein)) (in
sehr) riesig Bibliotheks (.) zu bleiben, und lesen, weil in Brasilien gibt es nicht
ne, also sind kleiner. (.) Das muss man sagen die Uni hatten weniger (.) also (.)
) hier in Europa in USA. (.) //mhm mhm// ((atmet ein)) Und dann als ich zuruck
kam nach Brasilien aus die USA das (.) habe mich entschieden ich wollte doch
(1) also (1) noch ein Jahr in Ausland bleiben ja //mhm// und haben diese beiden
Professor mich sehr unterstutzt mit ((atmet ein)) Empfehlungsbrief und (.) alle
solche Sachen //mhm// zum (.) der Dekan von der europäisches Unis dass ich gut
war, und (.) sollte ich dann ein Chance bekommen. ((atmet ein)) Und dann haben
die in Belgium (weils-) (.) meine Uni in Río is katholisch Uni (1) //mhm// und in
die (.) Universität von (Louvain ?) is auch katholisch, sie haben dann
ein gute Beziehung. //mhm// Dann war die Möglichkeit ein (.) eine Studium in
internationales Recht in (Louvain ?) zu machen. (1) //mhm mhm//
Dann hab ich alles (.) also organisie=rt wars alles schon fertig Immatrikulation
und all (.) und dann (1) hab ich mich (.) in bei Deloitte in Deutschland beworben
(.) un (.) dann bin ich nach Deutschland gekommen habe ich die Studium ((atmet
ein)) in Belgium gelassen. (1) //mhm// Aber da war (.) so immer noch in Kopf
dass ich das machen musse (.) also (.) diese Studium. (1) //mhm mhm// Hab ich
nicht aufgegeben ne ein Studium in Ausland und dann als ich schwanger war,
und ((atmet ein)) die (.) Erziehungsurlaub in Deutschland so lang ist (1) //mhm//
dann (ham wir gedacht) dann benutz ich (.) diese Möglichkeit (.) //mhm// um
meine Studium zu machen, ne und da hab ich in (.) deutsches und europäisches
Recht hier (.) in der Universität in Hamburg (.) die Studium (.) gemacht. //mhm//
Und das will ich immer noch (.) studiert (.) also (1) wahrscheinlich (.) zu die
zweites Kind da mache ich mein (.) Doktorarbeit @(.)@ @will ich noch ma- (.)
das will ich noch machen@ (1)

Although Ms Guzman-Berg favours working with the consulting company “Deloitte” over studying she makes use of her first opportunity to return to her previous study plans. In a different section of the interview Ms Guzman-Berg mentions that the only reason why she did not start a study programme directly on her arrival in Germany was her lack of language skills. When she then went on parents’ leave she used this spare time to do a Masters in German and European law.

These educational activities are not in any way organizationally connected to Ms Guzman-Berg’s job at “Deloitte”. Hence, they need to be distinguished from the further education undertaken by Ms Morales-Aznar and Mr Bergström. However, the Master certificate helps Ms Guzman-Berg to overcome the professional restrictions of her specialization on Latin American tax law. Nevertheless, she still does not become a lawyer in the lines of the German juridical system.

Far better organizationally connected to her career within the consulting company is a further education activity Ms Guzman-Berg has been undergoing at the time when she has given the interview. Confronted with the question of how her life will be in ten years’ time, the migrant underpins that she wants to become a “senior manager” in the company (Guzman-Berg, AD03, 888-893):

AD03: also ich muss fur die Firma die Steuerberaterprüfung no machen, (.) //mhm// das
ma- das müssen wir alle also deutsche //mhm// und ausländisch Mitarbeiter mus-
sen (.) //mhm// die Steu- Steuerberaterprüfung machen. //mhm// (1) Und das is
au also (irgendwie) (.) sehr schwer () //mhm// (1) Is ein Jahr Vorberei-
tungskurs () schon Januar jetzt 2006 (.) //mhm mhm// diese Vorberei-
tung (1) //mhm//

Her company obliged her to pass the exams for tax accountants for which she had to take part in a one-year preparatory course. Similar to Mr Bergström’s management trainee programme this preparatory course and the subsequent exam are organized for everybody without differentiating between migrants and locals. Although we do not know whether the preparatory

course has been provided for by the company itself, it is evident that it is closely connected to the expectations of Ms Guzman-Berg's employer.

However, as she has to pass the state-organized exam for tax accountants this further education provides her with institutionalized cultural capital with validity outside the company, too (in contrast to the further education provided for Mr Bergström and Ms Morales-Aznar). For Ms Guzman-Berg her enthusiasm for further education turned out to be very fruitful when in 2007 she succeeded in obtaining a position in a second company. In her new job she is not longer only in charge of Latin America but for the overall foreign trade activities of the company and for all foreign trade tax issues.

Summary: In the German context, formal further education activities organized in close cooperation with the employing companies turn out to be an important factor in the careers of migrants who work as managers on the free market. Such formal further education is evidently advantageous in different aspects: For the working migrant it is easier to combine further education activities with work (this is especially evident if one compares the narratives of migrants in Germany with those of migrants in Canada who take part in further education and have to work in [unqualified] jobs, see chapter 4). He/she can also be sure that the education activity meets the expectations of his/her employer. On the part of the employer such further education secures a high level of attachment to the company (especially where this education is provided for within the company and in a way also idiosyncratic, see e.g. Ms Morales-Aznar and Mr Bergström), combined with the fact that such education closely meets the company's expectations. The positive results of such further education are documented in the advanced careers of all migrants whose narrative accounts have been analysed for this chapter.

2.5 Comparative issues: How managers with foreign academic titles enhance their knowledge and skills in Germany, Turkey, and Canada

The comparison of cases across countries and status groups reveals features common to all migrants whose life stories have been analysed in this chapter as well as patterns specific for a country and/or the legal access to the labour market. As the following inquiries will show, these comparative results are also specific for the particular typologically situated case group under investigation: managers on the free market.

A major contrast between Canada on the one hand and Germany as well as Turkey on the other is the entrance level into the labour market. In Canada those migrants who later turned out to be successful started their status passage with unqualified jobs which they accepted only for the sake of "Canadian work experience". Having entered the labour market at this low level (and hence having accepted this degradation), these migrants then are able to return to their professional area where they first work in underqualified or short term positions. During these first years in Canada they informally learn the local codes of labour. Only after this experience and with a portfolio of references from Canadian employers they succeed in finding a position on the level of their foreign academic education.

In sharp contrast, the entrance level into the labour market in Germany and Turkey turned out to be quite high, i.e. on a qualified level. The migrants we have interviewed started working in their professional field or in a related area of expertise. Here they informally learn the local codes of labour. Whereas in Turkey this pattern of the status passage has been identified among migrants with subordinate legal access to the labour market, there has not been any similar case in Germany.

Another difference between Turkey and Germany lies in the role of formal further education. Whereas in both countries migrants learn the local code of labour working in qualified posi-

tions, only in Germany formal further education plays a significant role. In the respective cases investigated formal further education is a major column of career advancement. On the other hand, in Turkey we do not find such patterns of job promotion. It remains an open question to which social circumstances these differences may be ascribed. It might be a result of the subordinate legal access of the migrants in Turkey (vis-à-vis the equal access in the German cases), but it could also be connected with the country itself or it could as well be a combination of both factors.

Apart from these peculiarities of enhancing one's knowledge and skills, there are also transnational features: those concerned with language. In all three countries we find migrants who did not only attend language courses and hence engaged in (non-) formal learning. As is evident in the interviews these people have put much emphasis on informally learning the appropriate use of language, too. Such informal learning processes are usually situated in the context of work. Here migrants acquire what they consider to be the necessary skills in the local language. Even in those cases in which migrants fail to do so, the importance of an excellent command of the country's language is emphasized. The next chapter's analyses will reveal that this transnational feature is by no means generalizable but specific for the typologically situated case group of the managers on the free market.

3. Training on the job within professional law-ruled career tracks

There are career tracks which are – in contrast to those of managers on the free market – highly regulated by professional law. One of these career tracks is that of the medic. Or, more exactly, in the countries taken into account for the present chapter of this report – Canada, Turkey, and Germany – the medical career turned out to be highly regulated by professional law. In Turkey, as it is, professional law even forbids persons of non-Turkish origin to practice medicine at all. Given the strong professional regulations for further education during the medical career track, other, more informal or non-formal experiences of further education remain rather marginal in the narratives of doctors. Even language acquisition does not seem to be so important, although the reasons for this differ from country to country.

The following analysis takes up narrative interviews conducted with medical people in Germany, both those with full legal and those with restricted legal access to the labour market. As in Canada interviews with doctors who work within the confines of professional law unfortunately have not been conducted, I resort to two relevant interviews which I found in Henkelmann (2007)'s empirical study. The analysis starts with the importance of formalized further education (3.1) and goes on to discussing the relative irrelevancy of language acquisition (3.2).

3.1 *Transnational features: The importance of formalized further education for doctors*

Both in Canada and in Germany, the medical profession, highly regularized by law, allows foreigners to work as doctors only if they meet specific standards of institutionalized cultural capital and if they are prepared to receive further education in the field of their expertise. Hence, albeit some differences between Canada and Germany, in both national contexts further education is rather formalized. I will first examine the Canadian case and then turn to the German context.

Canada: Mr Duani, a Jew from Algeria, had studied medicine in France and Belgium and then made his first experiences in Canada during an internship in a hospital. Back in Belgium, after one year of exhaustive work on night shifts in a Belgian hospital he decides to sit the US-Canadian entrance exam for the medical profession in order to move to Canada. Having failed the English version of this exam he takes the easier way and successfully passes a French language based exam in Québec (see Henkelmann 2007, pp. 83-7).

This exam is the precondition to start an internship, if not to receive a professional license. This internship is part of the specialised training for gynaecologists. Although he could have done a second exam which would provide him with a professional license as a general practitioner immediately, he preferred to follow this well paid specialised training. When he later failed to pass the exam mentioned above, Mr Duani changed his specialisation and started training as a radiotherapist (Duani, 105-114, see Henkelmann 2007, p. 88):

D: j'ai bien fait la partie clinique, j'ai réussi ça, et j'ai pas réussi la partie scientifique; (.) j'ai vu que c'était si facile cette partie scientifique, j'étais allé voir le professeur de gynécologie, je dis écoutez vous pouvez me donner un mois pour étudier, mais non je donne deux jours; (.) j'ai dit deux jours pour étudier toute la médecine ça va pas non ? //@.@// alors j'ai réussi la partie clinique, tu sais ?//hmh// et j'ai raté la partie scientifique, et là j'ai dit là je vais changer de spécialité, je vais dans une spécialité, où je vais avoir le temps

d'étudier. alors je suis en radiothérapie. //hnh// j'ai fait la radiothérapie, (.) je commençais à bien étudier,

Having failed to pass the “scientific” part of the exam, and without enough time to prepare for a second chance (“deux jours”), Mr Duani has chosen to start a new specialised training, this time as a radiotherapist.

It is interesting that there is not a direct connection between the (paid) internship and the professional license exam. As much as the internship is part of the formalized further education for gynaecology or radiotherapy, it is only an informal part of the preparation for the professional license exam. Whereas migrants like Mr Duani do not mention any preparatory education for this exam, the specialisation training (at least that in radiotherapy) informally provides space and time for learning (“où je vais avoir le temps d'étudier”). Finally Mr Duani succeeds in receiving both his professional license and his specialised training as a radiotherapist.

In the case of *Mr Mbé*, a young general practitioner from Niger, the specialised training is so much in the foreground of his narrative account that he does not even mention any exam. This certainly has to do with Mr Mbé's general enthusiasm for studying and for gaining new experience, as is evident in the following part of the transcript in which he narrates his migration to Canada (119-125, see Henkelmann 2007, p. 95):

M: après j'ai fait la médecine générale, //ok// comme généraliste; //ok// alors je travaillais à l'hôpital, et puis j'ai travaillais dans une clinique privée comme, je le fais ici. //hnh// j'ai fait ça pendant deux ans, et comme moi je veux toujours, j'aime beaucoup plus apprendre apprendre, (.) et je dit bon; écoute il faut avoir une expérience, //hnh// soit une expérience française, donc eh aller en France ou à Paris, ou bien avoir une expérience nord-américaine, alors (c'est à ce moment) que j'ai décidé de venir ici.

Prior to migration, Mr Mbé had worked in different hospitals in Benin. In an everyday theory on his own self, he points out his general eagerness to “learn” and to gain “experience” which – according to him – has been the reason for considering France and North-America as possible destinations of migration.

When he got to know a medic from Québec, Mr Mbé takes the opportunity and migrates to French speaking Canada with the assistance of his new friend. While initially he had intended, on the completion of his specialised training, to go back to Niger, he then decided to stay. Although it is not really clear from the transcript (and from Henkelmann's interpretation) why he did so, Mr Mbé then decided to change his specialisation and become a general practitioner (11-18, see Henkelmann 2007, p. 96):

M: (.) alors eh donc j'ai fais ça, et puis au début je (suis venu) pour faire ma spécialisation en chirurgie générale, et ça pour retourner dans mon pays, au Niger, //hnh// mais après un an et demi de stage; finalement j'ai décidé que je faisait plus la chose ça m'intéressait plus, e:t j'ai décidé de rester au Canada, donc j'étais obligé de changer, au lieu de faire la chirurgie générale, j'ai décidé que je vais être un généraliste; c'est à dire faire //ok// la médecine générale. (.) alors=eh j'ai fais une résidence en médecine familiale ici, à Montréal,

Possibly Mr Mbé had previously chosen to become a “surgeon” because of the prestige of this specialisation. However it is evident that he preferred to work as a general practitioner and hence started the respective specialised training when he decided to stay in Canada. He then took over a medical practice in Montréal.

In Mr Mbé's account the exams, which he had to pass in order to start his internship and then to receive the full professional license, are not even mentioned. On the other hand, like Mr Duani's account, the internship is taken as the specialised training. Apart from the internship

neither of the two doctors mentions any course they had to take in order to learn the subject of their specialisation. The internship itself is described in matters of time (“après un an et demi de stage”) but not of content. The formal aspect of the specialised training stays, albeit relatively unfocused itself, in the foreground of the narration.

Germany: Although law regulations of the medical profession in Germany differ from those in Canada (access to the medical profession in Germany is almost only granted to migrants who are married to a German or have the German citizenship as ethnic Germans whereas in Canada one only needs a residence permit) one can identify similar patterns of experience in further education. In particular, further education on the one hand is rather formalised and strongly fixed to the professional career while on the other hand the migrants experience this further education as a matter of formalised internship rather than as an opportunity to adapt their own knowledge and skills.

Dr. Nazar, a general practitioner who migrated to Germany because he had married a German woman of Turkish origin, was offered a position as a “medic in internship“ (“Arzt im Praktikum“) by a member of the Turkish doctors’ association he voluntarily worked for. He then easily obtained the minor professional license (“Berufserlaubnis”) with which he could work under the “supervision” of a fully licensed medic for two years (Nazar AD05, 590-608):

AD05: ((atmet ein)) Ähm also in der Türkei hab ich fünf Jahre gearbeitet. (1) Ä::hm (.) musste erstmal beim Senat ä:hm ein Antrag stellen, damit mein Diplom anerkannt (.) wird. (.) Das hab ich gemacht, mein Diplom wurde anerkannt, da:nn: äh musste ich erstmal natürlich ein (.) Arbeitserlaubnis vom Arbeitsamt bekommen und dann ein Berufserlaubnis vom äh Senat. //mhm// für Gesundheit. ((atmet ein)) Ä:hm dafür bräucht ich e=einige Papier, aus der Türkei das hab ich auch gemacht, und dann hab ich immer äh so zwei Jahre ähm Berufserlaubnis. //mhm// Diese Berufserlaubnis ist ja (.) äh (.) begrenzt. (.) Unter, Aufsicht. //mhm// Äh (.) von einem approbierten Arzt. //mhm// Entweder im Krankenhaus=oder, woanders. (.) Ä:hm achso (.) ähm °wie es eigentlich zustande kam.° Meine Frau war am Anfang äh nur Türkin //mhm// also hatte kein (.) Staatsangehörigkeit äh als Deutsche. (.) Und dann hat sie das bekommen //mhm// erstmal (1) Ä:h (.) ich glaube (.) °Wann war das?° ((atmet ein)) 94 oder 95 ungefähr //mhm// hat sie das erhalten und da:nn (.) dürfte ich auch irgendwann mal Antrag stellen //mhm// für die deutsche Staatsangehörigkeit, ähm (.) das hab ich auch im Jahr 98 bekommen. //mhm// Ähm nachdem ich das bekommen habe hab ich auch mein Approbation bekommen und deswegen bräucht ich nicht mehr Arbeits- noch Berufserlaubnis. //mhm// Und äh ja. Dann war ich als approbierter äh erkannte (.) äh anerkannte praktische Arzt //mhm// tätig.

The minor professional license was (at that time) not bound to an exam, Mr Nazar’s work experience (“I worked five years in Turkey”) and his five-years’ study in medicine were enough to enable him to work in the doctor’s surgery of his friend. Another – and rather odd – condition was that his wife is “German”. Neither in this part of the transcript nor in any other, Mr Nazar mentions anything he has learnt during his internship as an assistant in the practice of his friend. Instead he underpins that he obtained the “German citizenship” in 1998 and then – after two years of internship – could receive his “approbation”, i.e. his full medical license. Hence, this career seems to be totally based upon the time of internship and the citizenship.

In the case of Ms *Mendelson*, a Lithuanian gynecologist of German descent, the internship she did with the minor professional license is not experienced as an opportunity for further education, either. Rather she describes how many papers she had to present to the respective body in order to obtain the minor professional license (Mendelson, AD09, 154-169):

Y1: Mhm mhm (.) ähm Ihr (.) Medizinstudium ist das:: anerkannt worden?
AD09: Ja, Medizinstudium sofort anerkannt worden, //mhm// wir mussten zwar (2) ganz viele, (.) weiß ich jetzt nicht wie viel, sehr viele Papiere vor(.)zeigen; wir wussten das aber schon vor der (.) Ausreise aus Estland. Von daaus konnten wir uns vor-

bereiten dafür //mhm// wir hatten alle Unterlagen, //mhm// schon vorbereitet wir //mhm// mussten alle Diplome alle (.) mh:::m Nachweisen aus Ausbildung nachweisen, //mhm// ((atmet ein)) alle Fächer die wir studiert haben nachweisen und natürlich auch die Zeit wo wir gearbeitet hatten hier //mhm// (.) nachweisen, (1) mhm ja und (.) nach diesem:: riesen Papier(.)kram den wir au vorstell- vorge- stell- konnten mhm wurden wir äh unser:: (.) Ausbildung anerkannt. //mhm mhm// (.) Am Anfang war es eine sogenannte (.) Berufserlaubnis, man durfte arbeiten als Arzt, //mhm//und nach einem Jahr, weil ich ja die Staatsbürgerschaft be- besaß ((atmet ein)) (1) und konnte beweisen dass meine:: Qualifikation dem ent- spricht der (.) d- d- die deutsche Ärzte haben, //mhm// ((atmet ein)) konnt ich auch die Aprobation bekommen //mhm// das heißt ich war dann voll anerkannt als Ärztin.

The time she worked with the minor professional license (i.e. under the supervision of a fully licensed medic) is not experienced as a time for adapting knowledge and skills. Obtaining the full license is rather a matter of the previous (formal) assessment of her institutionalized cultural capital and again – as in the case of Mr Nazar – based on time and citizenship.

However, Ms Mendelson has best intentions to get her specialisation in gynaecology ac- knowledged in Germany. When she fails to receive this recognition she starts the specialisa- tion training again. In contrast to the minor professional license and to the internship neces- sary for obtaining the full professional license, Ms Mendelson gives a (comparatively) de- tailed account of her efforts in the further education in gynaecology (Mendelson, AD09, 140- 153):

AD09: also insgesamt hab ich zwei drei Jahre in Estland auch gearbeitet ((atmet ein)) und die Zeit wurde auch hier anerkannt, (1) in Deutschland ((atmet ein)) äh auch die ob- die (.) Tätigkeit was ich da gemacht habe, ((atmet ein)) so dass ich nach- dem dann mein Facharzt- meine (.) Ausbildungszeit oder mein Vertrag in Kran- kenhaus abgeschlossen war, konnte ich mich für die Facharztprüfung vorberei- ten. //mhm mhm// ((atmet ein)) mhm mhm und die F- Facharztprüfung hab ich dann (2) 1999 glaub ich gemacht, //mhm// oder 98, (.) //mhm// äh parallel hab ich imme:r gearbeitet im in (1) in Praxen, //mhm// hab ich Vertretungen in Pra- xen gemacht, (1) °in unterschiedlichen Praxen° bis ich dann hier in dieser Praxis gelandet bin, //mhm// hab ich auch erstmal eine Anstellung ähm war ich ange- stellt //mhm// ((atmet ein)) hier konnt ich denn die fakultative Weiterbildung für Endokrinologie, //mhm// (2) in der Gynäkologie machen und (.) dann irgend- wann hab ich ein (.) mit dem Kassensitz bin ich in die Praxis eingestiegen.

During her specialisation training as a gynaecologist Ms Mendelson has to work in different practices, one of which gives her the opportunity to do a “facultative further education in en- docrinology”. In this account it is documented that while the specialisation training is, al- though it is narrated in greater detail, rather seen as a formal process to be gone through, the further education draws the specific attention of Ms Mendelson. This may have to do with the fact that this further education is not a compulsory part of the specialisation training but “fac- ultative”, i.e. it is optional.

Mr *Uslu*, a general practitioner who migrated from Turkey based on marriage as Mr Nazar did, pays some attention to the formal aspects of his further education too. In his account the internship on basis of a minor license is not mentioned at all. The whole narrative is framed by his struggle to find opportunities to continue his “specialised training” (Uslu AD15, 441- 449 and 487-496):

I: Mhm mhm (.) und können Sie erzählen wie es dann weiterging?
AD15: Und danach bin ich nach Deutschland gekommen //mhmmhm// (.) äh ich war ungefähr ein Jahr arbeitslos (.) äh dazwischen hab ich bisschen Deutsch gelernt, //mhm// äh und dann hab ich eine Stelle gefunden in Altona dort habe ich ange- fangen zu arbeiten und danach in Harburg noch weitere Arbeitsplätze (.) und dann in St. Georg und teilweise in Passau (.) ähm hab ich meine chirurgische äh (.) Teil absolviert //mhm// (.) und danach äh die Facharzt- ausbildung ist (.) beendet (.) //mhm// dann hab ich mich niedergelassen

[...]

- I: Mhm mhm (.) und äh wie lange waren Sie dann im Harburg, wie iss' dann weiter gegangen?
- AD15: 18 Monate war ich in Harburg, //mhmhm// (2) äh und also das- es ging auch gut es ging //mhm// mir auch gut und ich hab viel gelernt da (.) //mhm// und besonders äh Diabetes äh (.) das war die: diabetologische Schwerpunktpraxis, //mhm// im- also Insulineinstellung Umstellung //mhm// und äh alles was man äh:m mit die Diabetes äh umgehen soll; //mhm// (.) Schulungen (.) äh: und danach habe ich Herrn Dr. () kennen gelernt, //mhm// und äh er wollte mit mir arbeiten und danach bin ich nach St. Georg (.) //mhm// umgezogen @(.)

The specialization training is described as a succession of different medical practices Mr Uslu has worked in (“Altona”, “Harburg”, “Passau”, and “St. Georg”). The migrant receives a specialized training as a general practitioner (newly introduced in Germany). Against the background of this rather formal process of working in different practices and then “finishing the specialization training”, Mr Uslu’s account of the “18 months” he spent in a Harburg based practice are narrated in greater detail. The reason for this may be that in the “medical practice specialized in diabetes” he received new knowledge and skills on the subject. It can be assumed that this further training (e.g. the “courses” taken) is not a compulsory part of the specialization training but a result of Mr Uslu’s personal interest in the subject matter.

If one compares the three cases analysed above, three different patterns of further education in the careers of these doctors in Germany can be identified:

1. The internship these doctors go through with a minor professional license is not seen as an opportunity for adapting or enhancing knowledge and skills but rather as an obligatory time to be spent before one receives a full professional license. This formalistic attitude towards the internship is even intensified by the obligation to obtain the German citizenship (which takes about the same time as the internship).
2. Those among the migrants who want to start or continue with a specialised training (e.g. as gynaecologist or general practitioner) are very much concerned with the formal aspects and challenges of this task. The frequent (and obviously necessary) change of work place stays in the foreground of the accounts.
3. Only when these migrants mention volunteer further education some more stress on the content aspects of the respective courses and internships is documented in the narrative accounts.

These homologous patterns of experiencing further education are even evident in the case of *Mr Zadeh*, a dentist from Iran who, in contrast to his colleagues mentioned above, had to pass an exam in order to receive his full professional license (Zadeh AD21, 38-68):

- AD21: seitdem wohne ich in Hamburg. (.) äh natürlich zuerst hatte ich Probleme mit die Sprache, ich musste Deutsch lernen (.) und ((räuspern)) nach s-so ich hab also Asyl beantragt, weil sonst konnte ich hier nicht weiter bleiben, (1) und nach einem Jahr wurde ich als Flüchtling hier anerkannt, (.) und äh habe ich Arbeitserlaubnis bekommen, aber Arbeitserlaubnis ist keine Berufserlaubnis und ich habe im Iran studiert, //mhm// das war zweite Probleme die ich hier hatte. Äh nach (im) also hin und her und verschiedene Bemühungen habe ich eine Berufserlaubnis bekommen, da ich drei Jahre fast drei Jahre Berufserfahrung im Iran hatte //mhm// aber nur als eingestellte Zahnarzt, und jede zwei Jahre musste ich meine Berufserlaubnis verlängern lassen. (3) Ich habe in diese Praxis meine äh also äh eine Stelle bekommen, //mhm// als Assistentzahnarzt; das war so (.) November 1989 (2) //mhm// und da ich keine deutsche Staatsangehörigkeit hatte, (.) äh konnte ich keine Approbation beantragen. (2) und (.) also mehrere Jahren, dann habe ich als eingestellter Zahnarzt nur gearbeitet. (1) So 2001? äh habe ich meine deutsche Staatsangehörigkeit bekommen, (1) äh weil da durfte ich eine doppelte Staatsangehörigkeit haben //mhm// das habe ich beantragt, weil ich wollte auf keinen Fall äh ich konnte auch nicht richtig ausbürgern lassen, weil ich hatte keine Verbindung mit Konsulat oder iranischer Regierung, eine Seite und zweitens äh das war mir auch nicht so einfach das so zu machen (2) //mhm// und äh also ich hab deutsche Staatsan-

gehörigkeit bekommen und durfte ich jetzt Approbation beantragen (1) //mhm// äh aber da hatte ich zweite Problem, meine Studium war im Ausland; und keine europäischen Land; //mhm// deswegen musste ich zu einer Prüfung ein Sachverständigenkommission gehen; //mhm// das war natürlich nicht so einfach, erstmal äh mein Studium war mehreren Jahren davor und zweitens äh also das war auf andere Sprache, aber es war zu machen, ich hatte Erfahrung, und ich hab auch die ganze Zeit Fortbildungen gehabt, und deswegen habe ich geschafft, äh also diese Prüfung zu bestehen //mhm// und danach konnte ich Approbation beantragen. das habe ich getan, und zwar 2003, dann habe ich in diese Praxis äh wo ich gearbeitet habe mh also übernommen //mhm// und seitdem bin ich also selbständiger Zahnarzt. (1)

Mr Zadeh goes through the same ways of getting his dentistry diploma recognized and of receiving a minor professional license. However, due to some difficulties with the Iranian and German citizenship laws it takes him years to obtain the German citizenship. He therefore only applies for the full professional license after a new professional law has been published according to which he has to pass an exam. Interesting enough Mr Zadeh underpins the importance of “having had many further education courses” during his time as an “assistant dentist”, while he does not experience this assistancy as an opportunity for further education itself. In this sense the pattern reconstructed in the cases above is reproduced even in the case of Mr Zadeh whose career path considerably differs from the others.

Subordinate legal labour market access in Germany: Another case which considerably differs from those above (both in Germany and in Canada) but still holds some homologies with them is that of *Ms Damerc*, an Iraqi refugee who used to work as a gynaecologist. Being an asylum-seeker who has not been fully acknowledged Ms Damerc only has subordinate legal access to the labour market. Hence, she first has to overcome the obstacle of the migration and labour regulations (Damerc, ND01, 205-226):

ND01: dann er hat gesagt, „ja, so iss eine Ausnahme, wenn ha- wenn man andere Sprache kennt und zum Beispiel die, die andere, dann kann man, wenn die Stelle bleibt, dann kann man die Stelle haben“. Dann (.) ja, dann wir haben so, ich habe einmal so ein- in die Deutsche Ärzteblatt, ja, die suchen eine türkische oder so sprechende Ärztin, //mhm// und ich bin dort gegangen, und ja, ich habe gefunden, er iss ja, äh, aus (.) kann man sagen, arabische Länder, ja, und er will so, dann ich bin dort gegangen, und äh, ich habe ja angefragt, bei mir iss so und so, (xxxx) aber ich habe so gesagt, „müssen Sie die Stelle, wenn Sie bis drei Monate niemand, ja, dann müssen Sie noch mal wiederholen lassen, dann kann ich die Stelle einnehmen“. Und dann er hat gesagt, „ja, okay“. Und ich habe gemerkt, die Patienten bei ihm waren immer aus dem Irak, und die sprechen diese, unsere Sprachen, Arabisch, Turkmenisch, Kurdisch. Dann er hat gesagt, okay, und die ha- er hat wirklich- (.) viele haben sich beworben, die können nur Türkisch zum Beispiel, aber Arabisch nicht. Weil die beide Sprachen normalerweise geht nicht. //mhm// Dann ich habe die Möglichkeiten gehabt, dann ja, ich bin (.) mm, dort gearbeitet, so zwölf Monaten, ja, äh, und er hat gesagt, er hat gesagt, „ja, dann ja, kannst du vielleicht so zwei, drei Stunden täglich kommen“, ich habe gesagt, „nein, äh, ich bin drei, vier Jahre zuhause geblieben, und ich habe, kann man sagen, alles vergessen, ich will (xx) und ganztag“. Danach ich habe zwei Monaten so gemacht, dann er hat gesagt, okay, dann wir müssen äh, Weiterbildung beantragen, dass iss äh, unmöglich, aber das iss ein Versuch.

By taking advantage of her incorporated cultural capital in form of language skills Ms Damerc, with the (loathly given) assistance of the bureaucrat, succeeds in finding a job in a medical practice where she is legally allowed to work for the next year. When, after “two months”, her boss tried to apply for further education for her in the frame of a specialization training, he is aware of his long odds. Still Ms Damerc succeeds in starting the specialization training, but only to discover new administrative obstacles (Damerc NDO1, 226-256):

ND01: Und er hat Weiterbildung beantragt, äh, für zwei Ärzte, ich und einer war von äh, Griechenland, //mhm// aber die haben- ja, ich habe die Genehmigung gehabt. Dann ich habe gesagt, okay, das iss äh, ganz (.) ähm, als Fach Allgemein, aber egal, ja? //mhm// Was iss wichtig, was ich kann, ja, ich kann was machen, die

haben gesagt, das dauert fünf Jahre, ich habe gesagt, ja, macht nichts, egal, ich will weitermachen, ich hab bei (.) Doktor mm (.) zwölf Monaten, normalerweise muss man achtzehn Monaten beim Allgemein, danach muss man so zwölf Monaten bei Frauen, dann sechs beim zum Beispiel Chirurg oder Orthopäde, und dann (.) sechs bis zwölf Monaten so im Krankenhaus. Dann ich bin dort gearbeitet, aber ich habe nach so zwölf Monaten einen Brief, er hat keine Genehmigung für Ultraschall. Er hat Ultraschall in die Praxis, aber er hat das nur für Interesse gemacht, aber er kann nicht das äh, abrechnen lassen, er kriegt nichts für diese Untersuchung. Dann er hat gesagt, „was soll ich machen? Ich kann nicht Prüfung da, das iss schwer, ich muss mich vorbereiten, ich muss so und so machen“. Dann er hat gesagt, äh, ich muss eine andere Stelle @(.)@ das war ein bisschen schwer, weil er hat keine Genehmigung, und ich kann nicht weitermachen. Dann ich habe (.) kann ich sagen, ich bin zum- ich habe alles geschrieben, weil mit Weiterbildung ich kriege so zum Beispiel eine Liste zum Beispiel ((zeigt was?, knistert mit Papier)), das von innere Medizin. Ich kann nicht irgendwo arbeiten. Ich muss in die Liste haben, zum Beispiel manche haben zum Beispiel sechs Monaten, dann drei Monaten, geht nicht. Aber ich will nur sechs Monaten. Wenn ich zu jemand gehe, er hat zwölf, dann die sagen, nein, tut mir Leid, ich kann nicht nach sechs Monaten noch mal eine Ärztin oder so. (.) Dann ich bin- ich habe ich eine Liste gemacht, ich bin so eine Monate zu mm, fünfzig Ärzte gegangen, ich habe so gefragt, „ich mache Weiterbildung, und bei mir iss so und so, und ich komme aus dem Irak“, und dass ich muss so alles machen. Dann immer die haben, „nee, tut mir Leid, nee, tut mir Leid“. Am Ende ich habe eine Ärztin gefunden, sie hat gesagt, „ja, natürlich, Sie können uns helfen, das iss gut, wir machen weiter“.

When Ms Damerc is offered the specialised training she accepts that it is not in her former field of specialisation (gynaecology) but as general practitioner (“egal”). In the interview she then lists the different places where she has to do her internship until she can undergo the exams. When she discovers that her boss hasn’t got a license for “ultrasonic” she needs to find a new place for her specialisation training. Here she is not only restricted by the “list” of certified further education medical practices but also by her subordinate legal access to the labour market. Only after making an application with “fifty doctors” she finds a doctor who wants to employ her.

Again when she needed to work in a hospital she is told that she needs to get naturalized in order to be able to work there. This is because the hospital is not flexible enough to wait for the required period of three months in which it is made sure that nobody else suitable for this job can be found. Only with great difficulty and effort Ms Damerc finally succeeds to complete her further specialized training. In her case, it is not only the general bureaucracy of specialized training in the field of medicine which brings the formal aspects of further education into the foreground of the narrative accounts. Combined with these bureaucratic regulations Ms Damerc’s subordinate legal access to the labour market does not allow her any thought about the contents, the knowledge and skills she has acquired during her specialized training.

If one looks at the cases both in Germany and in Canada, an overall homologous pattern of experiencing further education is documented. Be it the internship with a minor professional license or the specialised training, both opportunities for further education are experienced as formal requirements for either obtaining the recognition of the diplomas they originally had obtained in their country of origin, or for receiving an up-graded license as a medical specialist. In both alternatives the further education provides the migrants with knowledge and skills which are immediately turned into institutionalised cultural capital in the restricted sense of the word. That is the migrants do not only receive a certificate for their further education (be it the full professional license or the license as a specialist), the worth of this certificate is directly acknowledged by the respective participants of this segment of the labour market most importantly by health bureaucracy and patients. In other words: Instead of being forced to *bargain* the worth of their certificates, these certificates *entitle* the migrants for specific positions.

3.2 Country-specific peculiarities in language acquisition

Although there are significant differences in language acquisition between Canada and Germany, I will not elaborate on this topic in detail. Rather I will summarize some of the results Yvonne Henkelmann (2007) has put forward on the basis of her empirical comparison between Canada and Germany. On the one hand, the Canadian doctors whose interviews I have analysed in this report have been conducted and interpreted by Henkelmann anyway. On the other hand, the cases Henkelmann has taken into account in Germany are very similar to those of Mr Nazar, Mr Uslu, Mr Zadeh and Ms Mendelson.

According to Henkelmann (cf. 2007, p. 137), language plays an important role in the choice of Québec as the destination of migration. The respective migrants had received their academic training in French which was a reason for choosing Québec as the place to live and work. In addition, their “positioning within society is accomplished through the legitimate language of French which is the dominant language in Québec” (ibid., p. 138). That is, these migrants are successful because they speak the country’s language and are appreciated by autochthonous as well as migrant patients. As French educated doctors these migrants did not have to learn the country’s language. If at all they tried to improve their employability by learning English. In sharp contrast, those doctors who migrated to Germany on the one hand had to acquire a fair command of the German language without being excellent in it. On the other hand their success as doctors is not based on their knowledge of German but on their skills in other languages which patients with migratory background prefer (French, Russian, Turkish etc.) (cf. ibid.).

Hence, one can easily come to the conclusion that in both countries language acquisition plays a minor role for doctors. With the Québécoise cases knowledge and skills of the official and legitimate language of the country in fact are a *conditio sine qua non*. But as the migrants know the language prior to migration they do not have to adapt themselves to it. In Germany language acquisition is not a big issue either – but for other reasons. Here the doctors interviewed can easily raise their market value by using the languages of their study places and/or home country. Doing so, their lack of an excellent command of the official and legitimate language of the country is of less importance for their labour market inclusion.

4. Further education as a loss of cultural capital

Further education may improve cultural capital in the sense that it enables the migrant to either use his/her academic degree on an appropriate level or even to gain a higher position on the labour market. However further education may also lead to a loss of cultural capital as our comparative analysis of migrants' careers in Canada and Germany reveals.

There are two types of further education as a loss of cultural capital, two types which seem to be specific for the respective countries where we have discovered them. The first type may be described as “downgrading education”, for it includes migrants with academic titles who, after a period of unemployment, in one way or the other attend non-academic training courses and then use these newly acquired non-academic knowledge and skills on the labour market (4.1). Whereas this first type has been identified in the German context, in Canada we are confronted with cases in which migrants attend academic level adaptation courses, but do not succeed in using their adapted knowledge and skills on the labour market and end up with poor jobs and high debts (4.2).

4.1 Germany: Downgrading education

In the German context we find several cases for which a combination of welfare state regulations and downgrading education is characteristic (for the following analysis see also chapter 2.4 and 2.5 of working paper no. 3).

Mr Shwetz had been trained as a car engineer before he left Russia bound for Germany in 1993. As an ethnic German he has the right to unemployment benefits and therefore the labour office is especially helpful to find him a job. With the financial assistance of the labour office he decides to attend a “retraining” course as a car-mechanic (Mr Shwetz AD 36, 51-68):

AD 36: **ich wusste bevor wir ausrei- äh nach Deutschland ausreisen dass ich als Ingenieur hier äh** kann ich nicht arbeiten; dass wir diese Sprachprobleme die wir haben zu Hause Deutsch äh so gesprochen, dass diese Sprache war nicht fremd für mich, äh aber öh (.) so so perfekt konnten wir nich, das hört man bis jetzt; (.) und äh @ja@ äh und äh hier bei bei der Arbeitsamt, so äh war ich als Ingenieur, auch äh ein Jahr stand ich da bei dem Arbeitsamt und äh da hab ich auch gesagt dann müssen sie mich in andere Stufe so als Mechaniker oder so; //mhmh// und die ham=die haben gemacht ((Räuspern)) und ich habe sonst nur gesucht Stelle zum äh mich um- umbilden; //mhmh// oder umlernen da hab ich auch ich war beim mh (Lang) ein guter Mann bei TÜV-Akademie; ich war isch wollte bei ihm, ich weiß noch einfache Ausbildung machen; und er hat meine Papiere gesehen, und sagt dass was wollen sie denn (müssen) sie in diese Richtung kaum gehen hier und hat nach äh in Köln, der TÜV-Akademie Köln, angerufen und mit dem Chef gesprochen, und äh hat dann gesagt da spricht (ordentlich) und steht vor mir //mhmh// hat mich dahin geschickt und ich hab äh äh neun Monaten da in Köln bei Köln äh so das war so eine Gruppe für Leute die für mehr als fünf Jahre aus dem Beruf //mhmh// sind, und äh da haben wir äh hab ich an neun Monaten so genannt das war einfache äh einfachste so als Kfz-Mechaniker-Ausbildung;

Mr Shwetz (wrongly) assumes that his diploma as an engineer will not be accepted in Germany. After one year of unemployment he is ready to take part in a “retraining” (“umlernen”) course as a “mechanic” although this means that his prior academic education will get devaluated. The course is targeted on persons who have been unemployed for „five years“, a condition which Mr Shwetz only meets if one totally disregards his career back in Russia.

However, this welfare state-guaranteed downgrading education turns out to be successful in the sense that Mr Shwetz can find a job selling spare parts for cars (Mr Shwetz AD36, 68-85):

AD36: und als ich schon ja mein Diplom war hier in Deutschland auch in '93 hab ich anerkennen lassen, war a- alles anerkannt, und aber als Ingenieur, ja es war war schwer schwer einzusteigen. ja einsteigen. //mhmh// und=in Köln äh nach neun Monaten ja mussten wir auch Praktikum, suchen, und äh ich habe auch äh bei dem Arbeitsamt in äh Krefeld hab ich mich gemeldet, dass ich für Praktikum auch äh °such° und hab ich einen Betrieb gesu- gefunden, //mhmh// es Autoelektrik-Service war das ja und ich hab auch angefangen, ich habe halbes Jahr hab ich so einfach (.) gearbeitet. ich äh ne Sozialamt hat mir diese Unterhaltungsgeld bezahlt, ja und ich habe da äh angefangen und (Firma is) ja und und nach meinem Praktikum-Ende, mh hat er mir mich da=in der Firma gelassen. //Ah ok// bei der Autoelektrik-Service ja; //mh// hab ich ich habe nicht in der Werkstatt angefangen, aber im Verkauf. //mhmh// ja. Verkauf Ersatzteile und so °aber ich° mh geschraubt hab ich nicht. //mhmh// und da war war ich bei dieser Autoelektrik-Service äh war ich drei Jahr=und (.) da hab ich ein ändern von andere Firma (von) der Autohändler Friedrich. äh der wollte auch mit Ersatzteilen noch zusätzlich handeln hat haben die mich eingeladen; hab ich da bei Friedrich angefangen das war ganz neue Firma denn mit Ersatzteile hab ich (.) gehandelt, auch ich habe Verkauf gemacht °alles°. //mhmh// (.) und ja (.) bei Friedrich war ich auch äh (irgendwie) sieben sieben oder acht Jahre;

It is within the internship during the retraining course where Mr Shwetz finds a job opportunity. Here he cannot only use his technical knowledge but also his communication skills as a person of academic education. Later on he will open a car dealership on his own.

A similar combination of welfare state and downgrading education has been identified in *Ms Shwetz*' statuspassage into the labour market. Ms Shwetz used to be a teacher for mathematics and physics before she started working as an IT-expert in a data-processing center. After her migration to Germany, together with her husband and their children, Ms Shwetz "received a retraining from the labour office" (Ms Shwetz, AD 30, 540-557):

AD30: so und jetzt mit dieser Berufslaufbahn. //mhm// (2) ich wa:r bis (3) als wir hier in Krefeld (.) angekommen sind, hab ich auch wieder eine: Umschulung bekommen, bei dem Arbeitsamt Krefeld. //mhm// die wollten mir (.) erstmal (.) Bürokauffrau, (1) äh anbieten, aber ich weiß schon nicht, ob sie das (.) die die Mittel zu knapp wa:ren oder, weiß ich schon nicht genau, warum das (.) warum das nicht so richtig gegangen ist. äh also a-eine ganz normale (.) Ausbildung. //h::m// ich weiß es schon nicht (.) genau. irgendwas war da (.) ein Problem bei dem Arbeitsamt; und dann haben sie mir angeboten (.) so ein (2) Lehrgang zu machen bei ((holt tief Luft)) äh in der Deutsche (.) Angestellteakademie, das ist so eine (2) Fortbildungsschule //mhm// in Krefeld. ((holt tief Luft)) ähm also das System (.) das Datensystem in dem hm alle Steuerberater, fast alle Steuerberatern i::n äh::: in der B- ((holt tief Luft)) (.) in der Bundesrepublik arbeiten. fast alle //mhm// zu diesem Zeitpunkt sowieso alle hm hat sich schon viele geändert. machen schon viele eigene (.) eigene Programme und eigene (.) da hab ich zehn Monate dieses Programm gelernt, (1) also das das war richtiges System. //mhm// ein ziemlich mobiles und ziemlich starkes System; ((holt Luft)) womit man die ganze (.) Daten für die Steuererklärung und so weiter und so fort verarbeitet;

In this part of the transcript it is documented that the welfare state and its organization (the labour office) totally defines the quantity and quality of the retraining course. Although Ms Shwetz first has been scheduled for a "normal" training as an „office clerk“ she then is redirected to a shorter course where she is trained in a data processing programme used by tax accountants. Hence, the former programmer is degraded to an operator of computer programmes. Similar to her husband, Ms Shwetz then succeeds in finding an adequate job with a tax accountant (Ms, AD 30, 558-580):

AD30: (1) nach diesem zehn Monaten, ((seufzt)) hab ich gleich nach zwei Monate an=eine Stelle bekommen, aber auch (.) über einen Zufall, (1) ich hab mehrmals (.) hm hm mehrmals ähm mich beworben, hab (1) immer a=wieder eine Absage bekommen, natürlich das ist klar weil ich hab keine normale Ausbildung gemacht, hm gehabt in dem Sinne, hm ((holt Luft)) dass ich bei dem ((seufzt)) Steuerberater nicht so gut (.) //h::m// arbeiten konnte. //hm-m// übe- über einen

Zufall, (.) mein Mann hat für mich, (.) er hat schon damals gearbeitet; in einem Kopierer, ((schnalzt)) also mein mein Lebenslauf (.) hinter gelassen; //mhm// bei sich in Büro da (.) bei sich in der Arbeit. und da: hat sein Chef, (.) diese Bewerbung also diesen @Lebenslauf@ entdeckt, hat gefragt was ist das? und da hat mein Mann ihm das erzählt, der sagt meine hm meine (.) hm Schwester, die ist Steuerberaterin ist Moers, //mhm// hat sich vor kurzem äh selbständig gemacht, und sie sucht eine Sachbearbeiterin. da bin ich nach Moers gegangen. das war auch eine Geschichte. ((holt tief Luft)) die Frau (Gehrichhaus) eine (.) einen (.) ((schnalzt)) ziemlich fitte junge Frau, in ma- (.) in meinem Alter junge Frau; @(.)@ @sag ich mal@. //ja// die: (.) äh (.) mehr äh ein Mann in Rock war als eine Frau, des war das Leben war hart mit ihr; aber ich hab viel von ihr gelernt. //mhm// am meisten überhaupt. //mhm// ((holt tief Luft)) und da bin ich so eingestiegen so kleine Schritten als Sachbearbeiterin, erstmal mit (.) mit Erfassung, und mit kleinen Postierungen, die Bilanzen hab ich natürlich nicht gemacht; das war nicht; mit kleinen Steuerklärungen erst. ja hab ich mich so eingelebt //mhm// ((holt tief Luft)) für ein ganz geringes Gehalt natürlich, das war (1). das war ganz knapp das Gehalt das; (1)

Ms Shwetz uses this job opportunity with its limited payment by acquiring the crucial knowledge in tax accountancy (e.g. the “statement of financial condition”). Doing so she improves her employability and makes herself competitive with people who have received a “normal training” as tax accountant assistant. Later on, when she was laid off by her first employer, Ms Shwetz was able to use her non-academic knowledge and skills, acquired both by formal and informal learning, to easily find a new job with another tax accountant.

As is evident in Ms Shwetz’ life story (and as can be assumed for her husband too), the welfare state regulated retraining course provides only a part of the knowledge and skills which have been decisive for these migrants’ success on the labour market. In addition, the practical experience on the job and the social networks played an important role during their status passage into the labour market.

There are also migrants who receive downgrading education outside their original field of expertise. *Mr Baako*, a Nigerian physicist trained in Czechoslovakia, does not pursue his (academic) career in Germany (where only a part of his studies is being acknowledged by the university) but works as a taxidriver and jobber. Whereas at the beginning he enjoys a life of leisure and (modest) luxury he later, after his marriage and the birth of his child, settles down in Berlin and looks for a more continuous job (Baako AD18, 236-257):

AD18: Und ähm::: ich hab jetzt nicht entschieden, dass ich gleich äh, wieder zuruckkehre. Dann kuck ich, was ich aus mein Leben machen kann. //Mhm// Dann fing ich halt an mit dem mitn Taxifahren. ((Holt tief Luft)) Un::d ähm, ja nebenbei privat hab ich mich immer mitm, mitm Computer wieder be- beschäftigt. //Ja Okay// Und dann, ähm:: (3) dann hab ich mich mal ähm, offiziell beim beim ähm Arbeitsamt gemeldet. //Ja// Dann hab ich ähm, (.) eine eine eine ((holt tief Luft)) °was für eine?° **Ja** das war so eine eine Wei-Weiterbildungsmaßnahme gemacht. //Mhm// Zum:: ((schnalzt)) IT-Systemberater hieß, hieß dis. //Hm// ((holt tief Luft)) Ja. Dass ging (2) Gott, fast n:::eun Monat ging, ja ging dis. //Mhm// Und ähm, weil ich danach nicht gleich n äh Job (.) kriegte. //Mhm// Hab ich weiter n n (.) Taxif-, Taxifahren gemacht. //Mhm// Und dann habe ich, habe ich ähm:: (.) mal ein Freund getroffen. Auch Ausländer. ((holt tief Luft)) Ähm, aus Vietnam war er. //Okay// Der war auch Taxifahrer. //Mhm// Und dann ähm habn wa uns un- unter- unter- unter- unterhalten und der der sagte,: Du ((holt tief Luft)) ähm, irgendeine Firma sucht Netzwerktechniker. Sehr viele. Ich hab gesagt,: wirklich? Der hat das ü-über (.) Der wohnte in Schöneberg. Und über sein:: sein:: ähm::: äh über sein A- Arbeitsamt hat er das Schreiben bekommen, dass er sich bei der Firma melden sollte. //Ach so, okay// Ich hatte, äh kein Schreiben bekommen. //Mhm// Also, aber äh,: kann ich mit dir (.) hingehen? So,: Pf, ja, komme mit. Dann warn wa da:: und s gab s gab s gab n ein ein Test. Und n Interview. Und leider ähm wurde er nicht genommen. Ich, ich wurde genommen.

Mr Baako is not entitled to unemployment benefits based on the virtue of his identity (in contrast to Mr and Ms Shwetz who receive benefits because they are ethnic Germans). However, with a several years of legally working as a taxidriver he takes part in a “further education” as

an “IT-system analyst” which is financed by the employment center (although it took him – as is documented in another part of the interview – great efforts to convince the employment center). With this „further education“, Mr Baako can tie in with his previous interest in computers. After a time in which he had to resume taxi driving, he finally found a job as an expert for computer networks.

Similar to the previous case, *Mr Ziegler*, an ethnic German from Russia who used to be a manager in the construction material business and had received academic training as a construction engineer, first works as an electrician because he does not receive (enough) financial aid to study engineering again. After a German language course he succeeds in finding the job mentioned above (Ziegler AD23, 64-72):

AD23: ich habe noch einmal äh ei- einen Kurs gemacht a- auch einen ein halbjährige Kurs äh auch bisschen Deutsch und mehr im neu Medium beschäftigt. ich habe damals erstmal Computern gelernt und äh es hat äh sehr gefallen mir //hmhm hmhm hmhm// aber trotzdem ich habe noch nicht gedacht dass ich arbeite in Computerbranche oder so was //hmhm hmhm// äh ich=habe eine Arbeitsplatz gefunden als äh Elektromonteur und //hmhm hmhm// mehr als ein halbes Jahr //hmhm// war ich als Elektromonteur beschäftigt

During this time Mr Ziegler started getting interested in “computers” although he, at that time, could not anticipate that this will once be important for his further professional career. After he then had to quit his job as an electrician for family reasons he was advised by “acquaintances” that the computer industry offered good job opportunities. He then attends a non-academic “retraining course” of “two years” (Ziegler AD23, 315-331):

AD23: und (2) und danach äh aber in diese:: Jahr habe ich mir entscheiden eine Schulung zu zu machen und ich habe gesucht. //hm// eine Stelle ich habe mir überlegen erstmal //hmhm// in welche Richtung wollte ich. //hmhm hmhm// und äh damals habe ich von viele Bekannten äh gehört dass in Computerbranche //hmhm// gibt es wenigstens viele: freie Arb- Arbeitsplätze //hmhm hmhm// äh da war ähm damals haben wir glaube ich alle gehört hm diese indische Computerkräfte //hmhm hmhm//diese @(2)@ interessante Geschichte //jaja// obwohl ich habe bis jetzt noch keine @(2)@ Indianern @in diese Richtung gesehen.@ //hm// ich weiß nicht wo @die wo sind diese Leute //hm// und waren sie wie in Wirklichkeit oder nein@ //hmhm// aber wenigstens ähm wegen **auch** wegen diese Diskussionen //hmhm// in Fernseher habe ich mir wirklich gedacht dass es dass ich kriege sehr=äh nach dem Schule könnte ich sehr schn- hm schnell eine Arbeit Arbeitsplatz zu finden. //hmhm hmhm// ja. es stammt äh es stimmt nicht @aber@ //hmhm// ja. und danach habe ich (2) ganz und äh gut äh zwei Jahre diese Umschulung gemacht. //hmhm hmhm// es war mehr theoretische als äh hm hm ganz (umgekehrt). //hmhm// mehr praktische als theoretische Umschulung.

However Mr Ziegler does not profit from this course, which he completes with a certificate of the chamber of industry and commerce, as much as he had wished. He stays unemployed for a longer period and finally ends up in an employment center-financed job as the “network administrator” of a charity organisation in Berlin (Ziegler AD23, 81-89):

AD23: und äh ein ich (IHK-) Prüfung bestanden //hmhm// und seitdem habe ich für äh versuche ich eine Arbeit in diese Branche zu finden //hmhm hmhm// jetzt bin ich beschäftigt äh als Netzsystemadministrator bei der Arbeiterwohlfahrt in Berlin //hmhm// ähm in andere Worten mache ich da **alles** mit Computern //hmhm// äh ich helfe ich äh Angestellten oder //hmhm// hm wenn gibt es irgendwelche Probleme mit irgendwelche Computern mache ich alles damit oder auch nicht nur mit Computern auch mit andere Geräten und so was //hmhm hmhm hmhm// ja

The retraining courses financed by the employment center do not guarantee job security, as is evident from both the cases of Mr Ziegler and – to a lesser degree – of Mr Baako.

The statuspassages of all cases analysed above have to be considered within the framework of the welfare state. All these migrants have – either by virtue of their ethnic identity or by their

previous contributions to the unemployment insurance – attended retraining courses which were financed by the employment center.¹⁴

Whereas welfare state regulations have played a major role in downgrading the cultural capital of these migrants, in the next case the lack of financial aid is decisive for taking up a non-academic training. It is quite significant that *Ms Luisa Fernando* does not only differ from the previous cases in this regard but also as concerns her legal status. For a long time she has been an illegal migrant who had to earn her living as a caretaker for old people although she had graduated with a diploma in medicine in Czechoslovakia. Being illegal Ms Fernando was not able to get her medical diploma recognized. When she married and legalized her status in Germany, she did not possess the necessary amount of money needed for the recognition of her diploma (Fernando, ND13, 120-128):

ND13: Aber damals, als ich diese Anerkennung wollte, die wollten viele Sachen von mir, aber die Hauptsache war das Geld. Ich hatte kein- ich konnte nicht jedes Mal so tausend D-Mark (.) //mhm// in mein Konto haben, als was, ne. //mhm// Deswegen hab ich so gelassen, und immer waren so verschiedene, „ja, du brauchst noch das, und noch das, und noch das“. //mhm// Und (da da) ach, (.) und dann noch dazu musste ich das parallel zum Deutsch lernen, //mhm// (.) weil sie- als ich kam, ich kann- ich konnte aber ganz ganz wenig, ich hab Deutsch hier gelernt, nicht vorher, gar nix, ne. //mhm// Und das war alles so ein bisschen (.) schwer für mich, ne?

It is not only the expensive recognition process but also the anticipation of the low income Ms Fernando would have when she would work as a “medic in internship”, as Niki von Hausen states in the interim report of the Munich team. Hence Ms Fernando continues to work as a caretaker and only after a certain time starts to take up a professional career again. Partly assisted by the employment office she starts an education as a nurse. After graduating from this training she works in a hospital.

Whereas financial constraints have hindered Ms Fernando, who was all on her own, from continuing her academic profession and Mr Ziegler from resuming an academic education at university, with *Ms Cani* we have a case in which the circumstances under which one may be able to resume university education can be analysed. I take Ms Cani as a case contrasting to those above, especially to that of Ms Fernando, with whom she shared a precarious legal status in Germany.

Being married to an Albanian refugee Ms Cani for a longer period is not allowed to work. When she then tried to get her Albanian diploma in dentistry acknowledged, she failed (Cani AD19, 344-365):

AD19: Und dann fing die ganze, lange:: Behördenrennerei:: Und häm, (1) ((seufzt)) und es war immer so, man hat öh::: klopf.. Und (.) hat, (.) man hat das da selbstverständlich (.) genommen, dass ich das schon wusste, (.) was ich da tue und so (.) Und ich //Mhm// Ich dachte da, (.) wenn zum Beispiel Landesprüfung hab, d=irgendwie hat mir jemand gesagt, für Medizin, //mhm// Bürowesen //hmhm// und so. Dann geh da hin, und so. Und sag,: ich hab so und so studiert, wie kann ich da weiter gehen? //Mhm// (.) Aber (.) diese Sach(1)bearbeiter kann auch nichts anderes, als nur das, was er (.) da (1) sonst immer tut. //Mhm// Und für den Rest, für den Rest von Fälle (.) kann er dir nicht helfen. //°Mhm°// U::nd okay, dann hab ich (.) ziemlich viel, viel Zeit verloren. (.) ((schnalzt)) Und äh:::m (2) Dann (4) glaub ich, ich hab, (.) Mehr als sechs Monate, bis ich dann endlich wusste, wie es weiter so geht. (.) Und (1). Irgendwann mal hat ich, ich weiß nicht wie-, wie viel später. Kann ja sehen. Als ich diese (.) Anerkennung

14. The reason why the employment center did not finance academic training courses lies in its institutional construction. Whereas the employment center provides for a huge number of non-academic training courses, academic (re-)training is only financed on an individual and exceptional basis.

von mein Studienleistung da:: irgendwann mal im Hand //mhm// hatte //mhm-
mhm// Na, mehr, (1) mh::: ja mehr. Es ist sehr viel Zeit verloren. Und das tut mir
echt Leid jetzt, weil, hm:: (1): Ich hätte viel früher studieren können und (.) ma-
chen //hm// müssen. (.) Äh:::m (2). Und in diese Sommer war so, (.) dass mir
wurde von ganzen:: (4) Studium (.) mir wurden:: irgendwie da stand von vier
Semester, anerkannt, obwohl ich mit alle zahnmedizinischen Sachen zu tun hat-
ten schon, von ersten Semester machen sollten. Sozusagen ich dürfte noch mal
(.) Studieren. //Hm// Mir wurden ein paa::r (.) Allgemeinfelder anerkannt
//mhm// die ich nicht machen sollte. (2)

It is even difficult for Ms Cani to find out how to get her diploma acknowledged. The univer-
sity only recognizes a part of her previous studies, so that she needs to resume university edu-
cation. Financed by her husband she is then able to attend the university courses without hav-
ing to care for her living (Cani AD19, 365-371):

AD19: (2) Na gut, ich hab gesagt, ich hab jetzt nichts, ich muss (.) nichts tun. Dann, (.)
Kinder hatten wir nicht vo::r oder so. Wir waren noch jung, haben wir gesagt,:
Okay, dann studier ich. (3) Dann hab ich wieder glaub ich:::, (.) bei (.) äh,
Zahnmedizin ist so, dass man (1): Nur im Wintersemester sich bewerben darf.
//Hm// Und ich glaube ich hab da, wieder so ein Jahr verloren weil ich //hm//
wegen der Fristen und so.

Whereas she explicitly points to the fact that she had not got a child at that time, she implicitly
relies on the financial assistance of her husband when they both decide (“we have said”) that
she should better study again.

This financial assistance may be crucial for a retraining on an academic level. Whereas Mr
Ziegler could not resume university training as an engineer because the state-funded BAföG
grant would allow a living for him and his family, and whereas Ms Fernando could not only
rely on the income of a “medic in internship” (her marriage was of formal convenience rather
than an intimate relationship), Ms Cani can rely on the financial assistance offered by her
husband. On the other hand, the financial assistance provided by the employment office only
leads to downgrading the education of migrants because it is reserved only for non-academic
training.

4.2 *Canada: Unsuccessful academic training*

Whereas in Germany university education may not be resumed by migrants due to the living
costs, in Canada the university and its inscription fees or the fees of other academic courses
themselves are obstacles for the migrants.

For example, “*Mr Bali* was advised to redo his degree in form of lengthy and costly training
courses. In his case this led to a two-year educational program designed to provide him with a
certificate for working in the IT/ Computer sector (“Oracle”). He completed these courses
while working full time. In the end this additional educational training did not really make his
institutional capital compatible for the Canadian market. Although the course was highly rec-
ommended to him by immigrant agencies as a way into his traditional professional field
(computers) it only left him with a debt that is hard to put up with as a recent immigrant.”
(Schmidtke 2007, p. 20) (Bali, ACAN17, 90-97 and 235-243):

ACAN17:Oh// I have been taking these courses, like, I took this seminar course, they’re
about \$600 each, not, and I spent \$15,000 on my Oracle, Oracle didn’t come
free, I went to school full time, so I’m just ending up with debt after debt and
when I will go looking for a job, I don’t know, @(.).@, maybe it’s my bad luck
or my bad timing. //I: mmh// But (2) they want Canadian experience (90-97)

[...]

ACAN17:But when you have two kids at home, I have to take them for soccer, I have to
take them for baseball, I take them for swimming, at the same time, I cannot go
to school, so it’s, I know how much it took a toll on me to do Oracle full time for
five exams, \$15,000, it’s not that easy. Believe me, I was the only one who was
working full time and going to school full time (2) I used to start my morning at
5 o’clock and then come home at midnight, and then again morning and used to

do, and then work week, it's not that, it's almost, it didn't go well, it didn't work much, because still you had to start all over again. (235-243)

Mr Bali is not only under the pressure to both finance his family and his courses (including exams), he furthermore does not succeed in finding an adequate job. Interestingly he does not refer this to bad advice offered by the immigrant agencies who failed to inform him about the importance of "Canadian experience" on the labour market, but to the "bad timing" and "bad luck".

According to Oliver Schmidtke, "*Mr Sahi*, an experienced accountant from India, voices very comparable sentiments and experiences while seeking to find employment in his field of training. As in a number of other interviews Mr Sahi does not only suffer from a non-recognition of his degree and foreign work experiences he also complains about the lack of coherent and, most importantly, transparent standards for required training and further education" (ibid.) (Sahi, ACAN10, 94-108):

ACAN10:No, much encouragement. So whatever we do, we do with our own efforts, and if that advice or right information is provided to us we could have saved a lot of time.//yeah// What we have achieved in five years it could have been achieved within one or two years. //really// Yes. So simply lack of information, lack of knowledge, lack of guidance, lack of things happening, we, we felt suffer When I went for my, this one, education, they said okay, if you want to go for CGA, uh, then three years, three to four years you have to take CGA, and it is since morning to evening. //really// So, survival is the first thing. So, later on I came to know that knowledge was not correct.

In spite of his re-training Mr Sahi does not succeed in finding an adequate position on the labour market.

"A similar story can be found with *Mr. Kulvamber*, a young Microsoft systems engineer who hoped that the two year training course would be his entry into the Canadian labour market. After this course he did not see any opportunity to land a qualified job and went back to his current career as a truck driver" (ibid, p. 21) (Kulvamber, ACAN08, 163-171):

ACAN08:I mean, a new immigrant comes and you put an \$11, 000 loan on him, where is he gonna, I mean I'm still paying my loan. Because of that I can't get a credit card because I have missed my payments, to tell you frankly. And //uh// I did a two years course, a CDI course, and they tell you, "You're going get a job, you're going to get a job." Completed this course, and 80% of these guys didn't get a job. The only guys who got a job were people who knew someone inside the company.

Oliver Schmidtke summarizes the situation of both Mr Kulvamber and Mr Sahi as follows: "Being advised to go into this educational programme by Canadian government officials both interviewees go through this elaborate training exercise only to find themselves without a qualified and well paying job at the end of the process. Both are increasingly caught in a downward spiral of material pressures, the need to re-qualify and an uncertain professional situation." (ibid.) Mr Kulvamber is quite explicit about the bad pay-off of his training when he is asked if he could use his new knowledge (Kulvamber, ACAN08, 213-218):

I: Yeah. So when did you complete this two-year degree that yo-

ACAN08:The diploma?

I: Yeah.

ACAN08:I think I completed it in 2003.

I: And since then, have you been able to use it at all?

ACAN08:Oh no, no, no, no. I'm driving a truck.

If one looks at the cases above, the professional situation of these migrants is clear enough: Although they had been eager to adapt their knowledge and skills to the expectations of the

Canadian labour market, it turned out that the assumed expectations eventually did not prove valid and that one has to continue “driving a truck”.

It would be a premature conclusion to alude this professional situation to the lack of welfare state regulations and to the lack of sound information on the labour market. As Mr Bali has suggested in his interview, it might also be the lack of Canadian work experience which caused labour market failure. This topic shall be further dealt with in the following summarizing and comparative chapter.

5. Summary: Transnational and national features of the adaptation of knowledge and skills to labour market expectations

When at the outset of this paper I have argued that further education is a *conditio sine qua non* for sustained labour market inclusion of highly qualified migrations, I did not elaborate on the question whether this condition is also a sufficient one. Neither did I specify the type of further education, be it formal, nonformal or informal. The empirical analyses of this paper reveal that this has been a wise (though not purposeful) reluctance. Further education is neither a sufficient condition for labour market inclusion nor is formalized further education the only way to adapt one's knowledge and skills to labour market expectations or even improve them. And obviously the meaning of further education varies from country to country, between the legal statuses, and from one typologically situated case group to the other.

There is one pattern recurrent in all three countries and with both the migrants with subordinate and those with equal legal access to the labour market: Adaptation of knowledge and skills, be it through informal, non formal and formal further education or not, is a good means to improve ones career *if* one is already included into the labour market. For the unemployed among the migrants interviewed or for those who only worked for the sake of subsistence (and for paying the fees for re-education), further education either leads to downgrading to a non-academic though still professional level or even to the level of unskilled labour. Hence further education is all but a *sufficient condition* for successful labour market inclusion.

Theoretical reflection: The different significance of further education for migrants already excluded from the labour market versus those included indicates that knowledge and skills obtained in the education system are not necessarily valued by the economy even if they are certified. In contrast, the economic organisations give credit to those stocks of knowledge and skills acquired on or in close connection with the job.

This general pattern gets its significance if one also sheds light on those features which are specific in one way or the other. There are peculiarities of typologically situated case groups, there are national features as well as combinations of country peculiarities and legal status.

Learning the codes of local labour is an important feature in all three countries, although this feature is restricted to the managers on the free market and has a different meaning from country to country, too. In *Canada*, learning the codes of local labour takes place already and only in unqualified jobs and then enables the migrant to find at least underqualified positions on the labour market. The accumulation of "Canadian work experience" in the long run implicates that the migrant is able to work in a position adequate to the knowledge and skills he/she had already acquired abroad. In *Turkey* and in *Germany*, those migrants interviewed learned the codes of local labour in higher positions as labour market entrance tends to be in qualified positions. This difference between Canada on the one hand and Turkey and Germany on the other may be interpreted in terms of permeability of labour markets. Whereas in Canada the labour market seems to be vertically permeable, i.e. migrants are able to rise up from unqualified over underqualified to qualified positions, in Turkey and Germany we can speak of a rather good *horizontal permeability*. Migrants who work in the field of management are able to enter the labour market on a considerably high level.

Interestingly *formal* or *nonformal further education* does not play a role in the career of successful managers with migratory background in Canada and Turkey whereas formal and nonformal education has been important for the migrants interviewed in Germany. However it may be assumed that the insignificance of (non)formal further education has different reasons. Whereas in Canada great importance is given to Canadian work experience (and the respective recommendations) even if it is gained in unqualified jobs, for those migrants who have been successful in Turkey the level of their labour market entrance was quite high. One may assume that in Turkey the subordinate legal access to the labour market (and the implicated insecurity of the job positions) is crucial for the insignificance of further education. (Another reason might be the fact that those migrants interviewed have been employed in small or middle scale companies which do not provide further education whereas bigger companies have their own further education facilities.)

Theoretical reflection: The sharp contrast between management careers in Turkey and Canada provokes thoughts about the relation between university degrees and cultural capital. Whereas in Turkey, (Western) university degrees are given credit to without any work experience in the country, in Canada such local work experience is so crucial that it does not even have to be obtained in qualified jobs. This shows that university degrees are all but apriori “cultural capital” (Bourdieu 1986). Under specific circumstances they might be given credit to and then used as cultural capital on the labour market. In other cases (as in Canada) foreign university degrees (and even foreign work experience) are only credited in connection with any local work experience. This shows that the value of university degrees is all but objectively fixed. However, university education neither is valued in an arbitrary way. There are specific though varying regularities concerning the credit of university education on the labour market.

Those cases of managers with migratory background in Germany who were successful although their cultural capital had not been considered transnational when they once migrated, took part in different (*non-)*formal further education courses, ranging from a trainee programme to a sequence of courses which provide further knowledge and skills in bank management. This (non-)formal further education was directed both to adapt and to enhance knowledge and skills. That is, as the employer did not assume his/her new managers to be acquainted with banking he/she did not make any difference between migrants and non-migrants but provided everybody (e.g. in the trainee programme) with a *training on the job*. By taking part in this training the respective migrants were able to obtain an academic level job and to make their career. (In both cases migrants had not had a job back in their home country, hence, they were new in a double sense: new in the country and in the job.)

Formal further education has been an *indispensable feature* in the careers of all *doctors* working legally in Germany and Canada. Regulated by professional law these doctors have to complete an internship and/or take part in further education conceptualized as specialisation training. However, be it the internship with a minor professional license or the specialised training, both opportunities for further education are experienced as *formal* requirements for either obtaining the recognition of the diplomas they originally had obtained in their country of origin, or for receiving an upgraded license as a medical specialist. The contents, i.e. the knowledge and skills the doctors (are meant to) acquire during this further education, are not even mentioned during the interviews. This is especially significant in contrast to those contents which the migrants learn voluntarily, e.g. knowledge about diabetes.

Theoretical reflection: The contrast between medical and managerial careers reveals significant differences between university degrees and state controlled degrees. Whereas university degrees are valued on the free market, the medical degrees are issued and/or controlled by the same state agency which structures the migrants’ access to the labour market. This indicates that the relation between university degrees and cultural capital seem to become looser with growing distance between the educational and the economic system.

The formalized character of further education for doctors contrasts to the managers in another aspect. Whereas the managers have to *bargain* the worth of their newly adapted or acquired knowledge and skills in order to receive the position they wish for,¹⁵ the further education of the doctors is immediately turned into institutionalised cultural capital in the restricted sense of the word. That is these migrants do not only receive a certificate for their further education (be it the full professional license or the license as a specialist), the worth of this certificate is directly acknowledged by the respective participants of this segment of the labour market most importantly by health bureaucracy and patients. In other words: Instead of being forced to *bargain* the worth of their certificates, these certificates *entitle* the migrant doctors for specific positions on the labour market.

Theoretical reflection: That the further education of the doctors is directly turned into institutionalised cultural capital and that thereby the specific stocks of knowledge and skills are not accounted for as single items, makes the observer overlook the fact that knowledge and skills as such are only cultural commodities to which credit may be given by the labour market or not. In contrast the managers on the labour market have to bargain the worth of the cultural commodities they acquired during further education.

If one takes into consideration only the migrants in Canada, there is still another significant difference to be detected. For the managers “*Canadian work experience*”, even if it is acquired in unqualified job, played a crucial role for their (qualified) labour market inclusion. In contrast, doctors do not even mention that they have needed such work experience. One reason for this might be the fact that doctors are assumed to be newcomers and hence referred to internships anyway (be they migrants or not). Similar to the migrant in Germany who entered the trainee programme the medical career provides a restrictive way into the profession which, on the other hand, is *vertically permeable* (provided one passes the entrance exams). In this regard Canadian migrant doctors share a typical pattern of labour market inclusion with their colleagues in Germany.

The comparisons between the several cases investigated in Turkey, Canada and Germany reveal that country-specific differences are less important than those peculiarities specific for typologically situated case groups. This is also evident as concerns the *role of language* which differs greatly from the managers to the doctors, but is in itself quite similar across the countries.

Among *managers*, in all three countries we find migrants who did not only attend language courses and hence engaged in (non-)formal learning. As is evident in the interviews these people have put much emphasis on *informally learning* the *appropriate use of language* too. Such informal learning processes are usually situated within the framework of work. Here migrants acquire what they consider to be the necessary skills in the local language. Even in those cases in which migrants fail to do so, the importance of an excellent command of the country’s language is emphasized.

In contrast, for the doctors *language acquisition* plays a minor role in labour market inclusion. With the Québécoise cases knowledge and skills of the official and legitimate language of the country in fact are a *conditio sine qua non*. But as the migrants know the language prior to migration they do not have to adapt themselves to it. In Germany language acquisition is not such an important prerequisite for labour market inclusion either – but for other reasons. Here the migrant doctors can easily raise their market value by using the languages of their study places and/or home country. Doing so, their lack of an excellent command of the official and legitimate language of the country is of less importance for their labour market inclusion.

15. This is especially evident in the Canadian cases as well as in the case of Ms Morales-Aznar. But it is even documented in Mr Bergström’s and Ms Guzman-Berg’s narrations. The further education Ms Guzman-Berg receives to become a tax accountant is different from the other further education courses as it ends with a certificate which *entitles* her as tax accountant due to professional law.

To summarize, the adaptation of knowledge and skills to labour market expectations reveals several patterns which differ not only according to the countries where migrants work but also with regard to their legal access and their typologically situated case group. With this kept in mind it is not possible to speak of “national features”, nor of an overall – transnationally valid – significance of legal access or of the typologically situated case group.

Theoretical reflection: The transformation of knowledge and skills acquired in university into labour market positions can be expressed in terms of cultural commodities, cultural credit, and cultural capital. Knowledge and skills, even if they are certified in university diplomas, are cultural commodities. During the search for a job they may be given credit or not. Only when such cultural commodities are being used on the labour market, that is when they are introduced into the production process, they become cultural capital in the strict sense. During the transformation of cultural commodities into credit and capital, commodities newly acquired during further education, may enhance the credit given to the university degrees. However, there are also other factors structuring the transformation of cultural commodities into capital, e.g. the residence and work permit, country-specific and case group specific peculiarities, networks, symbolic exclusion etc. Only some of these factors have been tackled in this paper. For others see the contributions to: Nohl et al. 2009b.

6. References

- Bourdieu, Pierre (1986): The forms of capital. In: J.G. Richardson (ed.): Handbook for Theory and Research for the Sociology of Education. New York: Greenwood, pp. 241-258.
- Bourdieu, Pierre (1990): Was heißt Sprechen? Die Ökonomie des sprachlichen Tauschs. Wien: Wilhelm Braumüller
- Brosius, Anja (2008): Handlungspraktiken hochqualifizierter MigrantInnen beim Arbeitsmarktzugang. Cultural Capital During Migration Research Paper No. 4 [url: http://www.cultural-capital.net/index.php?option=com_content&task=view&id=21&Itemid=30; access: 10.3.2008]
- Henkelmann, Yvonne (2007). Ärzte in der Fremde. Berlin: Logos
- Nohl, Arnd-Michael (2008): Mehrebenenvergleich und polykontexturale Typenbildung in der Migrationsforschung, in: Hornberg, Sabine/Inci Dirim/Gregor Lang-Wojtasik/Paul Mecheril (eds.): Beschreiben – Verstehen – Interpretieren. Stand und Perspektiven International und Interkulturell Vergleichender Erziehungswissenschaft in Deutschland
- Nohl, Arnd-Michael/Schittenhelm, Karin/Schmidtke, Oliver/Weiß, Anja (2006). Cultural Capital during Migration — A Multi-level Approach to the Empirical Analysis of Labor Market Integration amongst Highly Skilled Migrants. Forum Qualitative Sozialforschung, Volume 7, No. 3, Art. 14 – Mai 2006 [url: <http://www.qualitative-research.net/fqs-texte/3-06/06-3-14-e.htm>; access: 10.3.2008]
- Nohl, Arnd-Michael/Schittenhelm, Karin/Schmidtke, Oliver/Weiß, Anja (2009a): Cultural Capital during Migration. Monography in preparation.
- Nohl, Arnd-Michael/Schittenhelm, Karin/Schmidtke, Oliver/Weiß, Anja (eds.) (2009b): Jenseits der Greencard. Zugangschancen und -barrieren für hochqualifizierte MigrantInnen auf dem Arbeitsmarkt. Reader in preparation.
- Nohl, Arnd-Michael/Ofner, Ulrike/Thomsen, Sarah (2007): Kulturelles Kapital in der Migration: Statuspassagen von gleichberechtigten Bildungsausländern in den deutschen Arbeitsmarkt. Cultural Capital During Migration Research Paper No. 4 [url: http://www.cultural-capital.net/index.php?option=com_content&task=view&id=21&Itemid=30; access: 10.3.2008]
- Nohl, Arnd-Michael/Schittenhelm, Karin (2008): Die prekäre Verwertung von kulturellem Kapital in der Migration. Bildungserfolge und Berufseinstieg bei Bildungsin- und ausländern. In: Dirim, Inci/Mecheril, Paul (eds.), Migration und Bildung. Wiesbaden: VS (forthcoming)
- Ofner, Ulrike/Nohl, Arnd-Michael (2008): Weiterbildung und die Entstehung neuen kulturellen Kapitals bei hochqualifizierten Migranten und Migrantinnen, in: Alheit, Peter/von Felden, Heide (eds.): Lebenslanges Lernen und erziehungswissenschaftliche Biographieforschung. Wiesbaden: VS (forthcoming)